National Bulletin on Liturgy

Volume 27-Number 138 Fall 1994

Trinitarian Dimensions of Liturgy
National Bulletin on Liturgy
A review published by the
Canadian Conference
of Catholic Bishops.

This Bulletin is primarily pastoral in scope. It is prepared for members of parish liturgy committees, readers, musicians, singers, catechists, teachers, religious, seminarians, clergy, and diocesan liturgical commissions, and for all who are involved in preparing, celebrating, and improving the community's life of worship and prayer.

Editorial commentary in the Bulletin is the responsibility of the editor.

Editor
J. FRANK HENDERSON

Editorial Office:
NATIONAL LITURGICAL OFFICE
90 Parent Avenue (613) 241-9461
Ottawa, Ontario K1N 7B1 extension 276

Business Office:
NOVALIS
P.O. Box 990
Outremont, Quebec
H2V 4S7 (514) 948-1222

Subscriptions:
For one year, excluding 7% GST:
Canada United States International
1-9 copies $14 1-9 copies $16 US (air mail)
10-24 10+ $13 $14 US $25 US
25+ $12

Quantity discount for this issue:
For 50 or more copies to one address, 30% discount.

Publisher:
PUBLICATIONS SERVICE
Canadian Conference of Catholic Bishops
90 Parent Avenue
Ottawa, Ontario
K1N 7B1

The price of a single issue is now $5.00. Individual copies and back issues must be purchased from the publisher. Customers should add to the price the GST (7%) plus shipping and handling (14% on orders under $9.99 or 8% on orders of $10.00 and over.)

National Bulletin on Liturgy is published by the Publications Service of the CCCB and appears in spring, summer, fall and winter.

National Bulletin on Liturgy, copyright © Conccan Inc., 1994. No part of this Bulletin may be reproduced in any form without the prior written permission of CCCB Publications Service.

International Standard Serial Number:
ISSN 0084-8425

Legal deposit:
National Library, Ottawa, Canada
Second Class Mail:
Registration Number 2994

The Bulletin is printed on recycled paper. This reflects our concern for the environment and the conservation of our natural resources.
Trinitarian Dimensions of Liturgy

The God whom we worship and whom we name, address and invoke in our worship, is a Trinity. This issue considers the trinitarian dimensions of our liturgical rites and texts, and the consequences of trinitarian worship for Christian living.
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Trinity and Liturgy</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Trinity Through the Centuries</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Trinity Since Vatican II: Annotated Bibliography</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trinity Sunday and Its Readings</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Naming God, Conversing With One Another</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Trinity and Creation</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Descending and Ascending Christology</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Profile of the Spirit According to Scripture</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Active Presence of Christ and the Spirit</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Trinity and the Sacraments</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pentecost</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contemporary Challenges to Musicians and Liturgists</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catholic Book of Worship III</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Trinity and Liturgy

Dr. Mary M. Schaefer, author of most of the theme articles in this issue, is Associate Professor of Christian Worship and Spirituality at Atlantic School of Theology in Halifax. She received her doctorate from the University of Notre Dame, where she studied with the late Professor Edward Kilmartin. She has been a member of the subcommittee on discriminatory language of the International Commission on English in the Liturgy, and of the National Council for Liturgy, of which she was also the chair. She wrote the scripture commentaries for the Sunday Mass Book for Canada (1976), co-authored (with J. F. Henderson) The Catholic Priesthood: A Liturgically Based Theology of the Presbyteral Office (1990), and has published many articles in Studia Liturgica, Worship, Liturgy, National Bulletin on Liturgy and elsewhere.

Trinitarian structure of liturgical prayer: As the mystery of Three Persons in one God founds all reality, the dogma of the Trinity must, explicitly or implicitly, structure any prayer which claims to be Christian. This holds most true for the public prayer of the church, the liturgy. This issue of the Bulletin investigates the trinitarian structure of liturgical prayer. The theme we have set ourselves is daunting: the being and action of God in relation to the gathered Christian people. Our playing-field is the cosmos, our focus the word-and-action of a local praying assembly.

Theoretical and practical: Since tradition, theology, theory and practice need always to be related, both theoretical and practical helps to understanding and carrying out a trinitarian-based liturgy are found here. It is hoped that these different sources will contribute to consciousness of the Trinity in public prayer and help us to fashion that prayer ever more soundly.

Spirituality: Recovery of the doctrine of the Trinity also has wide-ranging implications for Christian spirituality. Since authentic spirituality is intimately related to worship of God and relationship to one’s world, to human beings and to all creatures, Christians believe that all spirituality – the way one’s life is lived in the world so as to relate to ultimate values – will eventually be “brought back to the Trinity.” If the invisible Trinity is the foundation of all reality, its vibrant life structures lived Christian spirituality; we should be glad to acknowledge this personal source of authentic spirituality, the Spirit! Christian spirituality, when vigorous, will have trinitarian roots.

Glossary

The subject of the Trinity has, over the centuries in both Eastern and Western churches, acquired a technical vocabulary all its own. Though it complicates our reading and study, we cannot escape at least some of this technical language. The following glossary is supplied as an aid.
Appropriation. A term used in Western theology, which stresses the oneness of God, to explain that all actions outside the Triune God's inner life should be attributed to all three persons together. Therefore, all three persons create, all three sanctify. Creation is "attributed" to the Father; revelation and redemption are attributed to the Son; sanctification to the Holy Spirit.

However, Eastern theology of the Trinity stresses that certain actions are proper to one person or another. One person can communicate self, that is, enter into a personal relationship with a human being. Incarnation is proper to the Son and not to the Spirit; sanctification to the Spirit. The divine missions refer to the self-communication of one person of the Trinity to a created being.

Arianism. A heresy in which the Father is the only God; he adopted as his Son the most perfect human being, Jesus Christ. But Jesus Christ remains subordinate; this was proved, Arians claimed, because the liturgy was addressed to God "through" Christ.

Christology: doctrine and theology of Jesus Christ.

Circumincession is a Latin word which refers to a communion in which all persons indwell and dynamically yield to the others.

Councils. Some of the important councils for the development of the trinitarian dogmas are the following:

Nicæa I (A.D. 325): Jesus Christ, Son of God, is "from the being (ousia) of the Father, God from God, Light from Light, true God from true God, begotten, not made, one in being (homoousios) with the Father, through whom all things were made, those in heaven and those on earth."

Constantinople I (381): "(We believe) in the Holy Spirit, the Lord and Giver of life, who proceeds from the Father, who together with the Father and the Son is adored and glorified, who has spoken through the prophets."

Toledo I (400): To refute Arianism, Toledo stated that the Holy Spirit proceeds from the Father and the Son (the Filioque). "There exists also the Spirit Paraclete, who is neither the Father nor the Son, but who proceeds from the Father and the Son. So the Father is unoriginate, the Son begotten, the Holy Spirit not begotten but proceeding from the Father and the Son."

Toledo III (589) ordered the Filioque inserted into the Nicene-Constantinopolitan Creed. At the coronation of Henry II by Benedict VIII in Rome (1014), the Creed with the Filioque was sung in St. Peter's.

Lateran IV (1215): The Trinity is the sole principle of the universe.

Florence (1439-1445): The Decree for the Greeks was intended to reconcile the Western Filioque with the Greek "from the Father through the Son (per filium)." The Decree for the Jacobites (Copts and Ethiopians, 1442) read: "All that the Father is or has, He has not from another, but from Himself; He is the origin without origin. . . . . The Father is wholly in the Son and wholly in the Holy Spirit; the Son is wholly in the Father and wholly in the Holy Spirit; the Holy Spirit is wholly in the Father and wholly in the Son."

Dogma: Doctrines of the Church explicitly established as revealed by God and requiring the assent of faith, and contained in the word of God addressed to us in Scripture and/or Tradition.
Economic and immanent Trinity. The “economy” refers to God's saving work in the world. It comes from the Greek οἰκονομία, referring to the phases of a progressively realized divine plan brought about by the persons of the Trinity present within the history of salvation. From the way God reveals self at work in the world we learn about God's inner or “immanent” life. Immanent refers to the internal relations among the three persons in God.

Filioque means “and the Son” in Latin. See above, under Councils, I and III Toledo and Florence.

Homoousios means “of the same stuff.” The Son is of the same "stuff" as the Father.

Hypostasis is a term favoured by the East, where the West uses person. It refers to the individual existence of a particular nature.

Modalism: A heresy according to which one God manifests self through three modes of revelation in history. The one God as creator is “called” Father, the same God in the aspect of redeemer is called Son; as sanctifier the same God is called Spirit.

Monarchy means origin from the Father; this is emphasized by the East.

Perichoresis means literally, in Greek, a dancing around together; the interpenetration of the divine persons.

Person from persona, originally referring to the mask which disguised an actor’s features in Greek and Roman theatre; it was then applied to a character of a play, and hence to a human being. A person is relational but unique. In the Trinity, the divine being in a determined mode of existence. Common/opposition in the persons of the Trinity: Everything is common to the three persons except where there is “opposition of relationship.”


Procecssions: There are only two, of the Word and of the Spirit. They originate with the Father.

Trinity. The term was created by Tertullian (160-220): Three are one. The revealed mystery that God is one in nature and three in distinct persons. The doctrine of the Trinity was brought to a high development and degree of consenss during the fourth century.

Tritheism. Faith in three autonomous gods. Left out are the notions of relationship and communion between them.
Scriptural roots: As the mystery of the Trinity is the foundation of all reality, so the doctrine of the Trinity stands at the heart of theology. The Christian scriptures contain the seeds of trinitarian doctrine, but only in a “first-order” fashion. That is, the New Testament shows God at work as three persons. This is evident in the accounts of Jesus’ baptism in the Jordan:

And when Jesus had been baptized, just as he came up from the water, suddenly the heavens were opened to him and he saw the Spirit of God descending like a dove and alighting on him. And a voice from heaven said, ‘This is my Son, the Beloved, with whom I am well pleased.’

(Matthew 3.16-17)

Baptismal formula: Matthew gives a command of Jesus at his ascension, surely shaped by an early interrogatory baptismal formula, where there is no suggestion that one Person might be subordinate to another.

Jesus came and said to them, ‘All authority in heaven and on earth has been given to me. Go therefore and make disciples of all nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father and of the Son and of the Holy Spirit . . .’

(Matthew 28.18-19)

At prayer, Christians pray in the Spirit, with Christ, to “Abba”:

When we cry, ‘Abba! Father!’ it is that very Spirit bearing witness with our spirit that we are children of God, and if children, then heirs, heirs of God and joint heirs with Christ . . .

(Romans 8.15b-17a)

Paul draws a parallel between Christ and the Spirit, whom St. Irenaeus of Lyons (died ca. 202) will call “the two hands of God at work in the world.”

I appeal to you, brothers and sisters, by our Lord Jesus Christ and by the love of the Spirit, to join me in earnest prayer to God on my behalf.

(Romans 15.30)

In these and other “triadic” formulas’ the narrative of faith is told. No “definitions” of the triune God are given. It remained to be seen how faith would reflect on this narrative and make sense of it in the years to come.

---

1 See also 1 Corinthians 12.4-6, 2 Corinthians 1.21-22 and 13.13, Ephesians 4.4-6, and 1 Peter 1.2. Karl Rahner gives a complete list in “Theos in the New Testament,” Theological Investigations, I (Baltimore: Helicon, 1961), 141, n.1. In this important article he discusses especially the attribution of the term “God,” which in the New Testament is almost always the title of the one who will come to be called the First Person of the Trinity.
The experience of God shaped prayer to God. Attempts to articulate the relationship of God, Jesus Christ, and the Spirit, however, led to some fundamental disagreements over the implication of prayer formulas. The seeds were sown for theological controversy. Did prayer to God, offered through Christ as mediator, in the power of the Holy Spirit, mean that Christ was subordinate to the Father?¹

The First Council of Nicaea was convened in A.D. 325 by the emperor Constantine to counter Arianism, the view that Jesus Christ was subordinate to God in his divinity or was a human being only "adopted" by God at the baptism. The work of the council was "christological"; that is, it dealt with the person of Christ, declaring that Jesus Christ was homoousios, "of one substance" with the Father; literally "of the same stuff." This is the creed developed at Nicaea:

We believe in one God, the Father almighty, maker of all things, visible and invisible. And in one Lord Jesus Christ, the Son of God, begotten from the Father, only begotten, that is from the substance of the Father, God from God, light from light, true God from true God, begotten not made, of one substance with the Father, through whom all things came into being . . . who because of us men [(homines)] and because of our salvation, came down and became incarnate, becoming man [(homo)], suffered and rose again on the third day, ascended to the heavens, and will come to judge the living and the dead;

And in the Holy Spirit. ²

No biography of the Spirit: In this earliest Nicene creed no attempt was made to describe or assign attributes to the Spirit. In fact, writing a "biography of the Holy Spirit" has always proved to be impossible, and it was no easy task to put in theological terms what was the New Testament witness, the faith of the church and the confession of ecclesial prayer: that the Holy Spirit was so intimately related to Father and Son as to also be of the same substance.³ This was the task the First Council of Constantinople (A.D. 381) took upon itself. First it fleshed out the mission of the divine Son in assuming human nature so that all humanity might be brought with Christ back to God:

. . . one Lord Jesus Christ, only-begotten Son of God . . . who on account of us men [(homines)] and on account of our salvation descended from the heavens, and was incarnate of the Holy Spirit of the Virgin Mary, and was made man [(homo)], crucified also for us under Pontius Pilate, suffered and was buried, and rose on the third day according to the Scriptures and ascended into heaven, sits at the right hand of the Father, and will come again with glory . . . .⁴

"Descending," then "ascending" christology is given narrative voice here. The divine Word takes on human nature so completely as to live life, suffer

⁴ DS, 150.
and die fully subject to all that human nature can be subject to (except that he is without sin).

A pneumatology: Then the council made its special contribution, with the formulation of a "pneumatology" (doctrine of the Spirit, from the Greek word pneuma):

We believe in the Holy Spirit, the Lord and Giver of life, who proceeds from the Father, with the Father and the Son he is worshipped and glorified. He has spoken through the prophets.⁵

The Holy Spirit is equal in divinity with Father and Son. The profile of the Spirit is spare but expansive, for the next line refers to the church, with which the Spirit has had particular involvement since Pentecost: "And one holy catholic and apostolic church."

The filioque: After the Trinitarian dogmas had been developed by the great councils of the fourth century, and the doctrine was declared at the Council of Chalcedon in A.D. 451 that in Jesus Christ there are two natures, divine and human,⁶ skirmishes were fought until the dispute over the inclusion of the filioque in the Creed in the West helped to precipitate the Great Schism of 1054 between the churches of East and West.⁷

Schism: Almost from the moment of division, the vitality of trinitarian doctrine began to wane; it was no longer nourished in a living manner from its roots, the patristic traditions of the undivided churches of both East and West. Questions were raised on the most sacred of fronts. Christian brothers and sisters became strangers in what was primary to the maintenance and growth of faith: common worship.

Abstract and Aristotelian: To be sure, scholastic theology developed its treatises on the Trinity. But these became increasingly abstract, even unintelligible to those not educated in the new universities, where Aristotelian philosophy fashioned categories and modes of theological expression foreign to biblical salvation history.

Theology separated from liturgy: Coinciding with the loss in the West of the connection to the integral and still-living patristic heritage came the lapse of acknowledgement of the active roles of the risen Lord and Holy Spirit in the liturgy. This loss was especially noteworthy in the new scholastic treatises on sacramental theology which were separated from reflection on the liturgy.

Ecclesiology

Clergy and laity: Lost too was a way of grounding the theological explanation for the active participation of all the baptized in the church's life. The split of laos (whole people of God) into two strata, clergy and laity, which had hap-

⁵ DS, 150.
⁶ Deum vere et hominem vere is the wording. See DS, 301, 302; and Kelly, Early Christian Doctrines, 339-340.
⁷ Apparently used first in Spain, the filioque ("and the Son") was introduced into the creed sung at the coronation mass of Henry II in St. Peter's basilica in Rome in 1014. Although the councils of Lyons (1274) and Florence (1439-45) reviewed this Western addition, the first real steps toward the healing of the schism between the old churches of the East and the Church of Rome were prepared for at Vatican Council II.
pened gradually, was carried over into all realms: social, political, ecclesiologi-
cal, canonical, devotional. Charisms (the gifts of grace given by the Spirit for
upbuilding the church) were seen as bestowed on the ordained to enable them
to carry out their public roles. Apart from the socially and politically well-placed
nobility, laity came to be viewed as passive sharers in ecclesial life; their
sphere of influence was limited exclusively to "the world."

**Understandable categories needed:** Any dogma retains its power to inspire
and to enliven faith so long as it provides intelligibility for and throws fresh light
on life lived in Christ every day, as well as on the major issues which engage
an era. The ongoing task of theologians as well as of preachers and teachers
is to present the dogma in question in understandable and relevant categories.

**Out of the mainstream:** But to talk about Trinity (that is, to theologize) is
demanding. A recent extensive treatment of trinitarian doctrine notes that,
insofar as theology of Trinity has focused on God in Godself (God's self-relat-
edness), this "has kept it out of the mainstream of theology and piety." Such a
focus has been especially characteristic of Latin scholastic theology.
Remarkably, Christian theologians managed to divest the trinitarian mystery of
its fascination and, in the West, paid little attention to it themselves. Finally, the
doctrine of the Trinity virtually dropped out of sight, not least in post-Tridentine
dogmatic treatises and in seminary training.

**Recovery of Trinitarian Thinking**

**Things have changed** in the last fifteen years or so. The theology of Trinity,
thanks be to God, is in process of being recovered. What accounts for its redis-
covery? Prior to Vatican Council II and with an increasingly ecumenical aware-
ness, revitalized study of the scriptures using modern scientific methods
opened up new interpretations of scriptural data. Comparative study of the
historical forms and content of Christian liturgies recovered ancient under-
standings and ways of praying. Ample raw materials were therefore available
once the conversations and reforms set in motion by Vatican Council II got
underway.

**Trinitarian structure of prayer:** Of greatest importance was the recovery of
the structure of trinitarian prayer by the churches of the West. Of course,
prayer to the triune God had never been lost from the church's worship. How-
ever, prayer's trinitarian dimensions were at best obscure in the West. Since
Augustine, western theologians had begun their theological reflections from
the unity of the divine essence, with the distinction of the individual Persons a
kind of afterthought. Both in prayer and in theology (and therefore in every
other facet of the life of faith), God was approached as essentially binitarian
(two-personed). Official liturgical prayer was addressed to Almighty God
"through Jesus Christ our Lord." The "Holy Ghost" had dropped out of sight.
Except for the closing doxology in liturgical prayer, the Spirit was not only
invisible but also mostly unmentioned. It is hardly surprising that in ecclesial
life the role and dynamic action of the Spirit were not taken into account.

---

*Catherine Mowry LaCugna, God For Us: The Trinity and Christian Life* (San Francisco: Harper
1991), 320.
Ecumenism

Modern Catholic recovery of the Trinity began with the official documents of Vatican Council II, in particular the Decree on Ecumenism, which makes reference to

the sacred mystery of the unity of the Church, in Christ and through Christ, with the Holy Spirit energizing its various functions. The highest exemplar and source of this mystery is the unity, in the Trinity of Persons, of one God, the Father and the Son in the Holy Spirit. The trinitarian mystery enables Christ’s disciples to better understand how integral faith can be maintained in faith communities different from their own.

The renewed liturgies mandated by the Council show differing levels of awareness of the personal missions of Christ and the Holy Spirit in the economy of salvation. Renewal was actual to the extent that the various liturgies received, from the whole authentic tradition of Christian liturgical prayer, integrating elements previously lacking to them.

---

9 Decree on Ecumenism, 2. A development in trinitarian consciousness can be traced in conciliar documents promulgated over the course of the Council. The Constitution on the Liturgy named the Holy Spirit only five times although the activity of God and especially of Christ (nos. 7, 33) was noted. Eastern bishops were especially insistent on naming the persons of the Trinity. Vatican Council II did not achieve a full trinitarian theology or ecclesiology, but it did lay the groundwork for these.

10 Elsewhere in this issue the renewed rites are analyzed for acknowledgement of the personal missions of Christ and the Spirit. “Reception” of spiritual goods (in this instance, of the active roles of Christ and the Spirit, legacy of patristic liturgical theology) takes place in a variety of ways and at different levels and speeds; see Mary M. Schaefer, “Reception of the BEM Document,” National Bulletin on Liturgy, no. 104 (May-June 1986) 132-135.
The Trinity Since Vatican II: Annotated Bibliography

Mary M. Schaefer

The theme of the Trinity presents one of the most difficult subjects in the entire arena of Christian faith seeking understanding (theology). Older discussions depended on the knowledge of abstruse philosophical categories. The new wave of theology of the Trinity shows a turn to the realities of the Christian life as it is lived by faithful people. It concerns itself with how God works in the world.

Thanks to the scriptures and to the liturgy, every Christian has first-hand experience of address to and talk about the three-personed God. Even if we have learned about our God as children, we have some knowledge of the Trinity; do not think that children cannot "understand" trinitarian language while adults can! It may be that children can show us how to actualize the trinitarian dogma in our lives of faith. It is inexcusable to shove aside this incomprehensible Mystery as "too difficult." After all, the Trinity IS Ultimate Reality and Meaning, and therefore impinges on who we are and everything that we do. Like the backbone of the human skeleton, it gives shape and structure to the entirety of Christian faith expression. (Where the Trinity is not evident, the Christian heritage has lost its essence.)

The annotated bibliography that follows indicates some new orientations found in theology of the Trinity. A systematic doctrinal approach is taken by most of contributors. While systematic theologians generally refer in passing to sacraments, only those in the next to last section below offer substantial contributions from the perspective which liturgy offers.

From Scholasticism to Modern Catholic Theology


Karl Rahner, The Trinity (New York: Seabury 1974; original 1967). This small work, appreciative of Lonergan, had a large impact, especially in the connection it drew between the immanent and economic Trinity: "The mystery of the Trinity is for us a mystery of salvation." The axiom has since gained acceptance
almost everywhere: the ‘economic’ Trinity is the ‘immanent’ Trinity and the ‘immanent’ Trinity is the ‘economic’ Trinity. Christology and grace belong to the doctrine of the Trinity. What these statements mean is worked out by many of the authors noted below.


Classical Trinitarian Theology

The following works emphasize the “economic” Trinity, that is God at work in the world.

Anthony Kelly, *The Trinity of Love: A Theology of the Christian God* (Wilmington: Michael Glazier 1989). This work provides an easily understood introduction to history and theology. It is inspired by Augustine’s trinitarian analogy: the experience of a lover, the beloved, and the love uniting them.


Implications of Renewed Trinitarian Theology for Christian Life


The theme of community is highlighted by the following works.


Theology of the Holy Spirit

These works have important implications for ascending christology and the work of God in the world.


**Liturgy and Liturgical-Sacramental Theology**


Jean Corbon, a Maronite theologian, has written *The Wellspring of Worship* (New York: Paulist 1988; original 1980), in which spirituality and theology intertwine through the medium of reflection on the liturgy. Its trinitarian model is the Eastern "procession" model; its christology is chiefly "descending."

Following the liturgical framework set out by Corbon, but using Coffey's bestowal model of the Trinity, Edward J. Kilmartin's *Christian Liturgy: Theology and Practice. I. Systematic Theology of Liturgy* (Kansas City: Sheed & Ward 1988), seeks to reconcile the different starting points of East and West while developing a systematic theology of liturgy which in every aspect is brought back to its trinitarian roots.

In his *Culture and the Praying Church*, Canadian Studies in Liturgy 5 (Ottawa: CCCB 1990), Kilmartin revises an earlier study originally given as a series of lectures to the Syro-Malabar community in Rome, applying the principles developed in *Christian Liturgy* to the question of an ecclesiology which favours true liturgical inculturation. It provides a simplified entrée to the larger work.

**Inclusive Imagery and Language for God**

A number of authors above, beginning with Congar, address to some degree the problems raised by the masculine God-language and imagery associated
especially with the Johannine tradition and with the Fathers. The following works take up the challenge.


The collection edited by Alvin F. Kimel, *Speaking the Christian God: The Holy Trinity and the Challenge of Feminism* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans 1992), challenges the whole analogical project of feminine metaphors as applied to God. While readers may concur with the contributors' disavowal of the more radical positions cited, this chiefly Protestant collection is too uncomfortable with analogy to dialogue fruitfully with the Catholic authors named in the remainder of this bibliography. In general, Scripture is viewed as a record of direct revelation, and metaphors for God are treated as "revealed." Language theory is given more space than theology, so the variety of trinitarian models is not explored.
Trinity Sunday and Its Readings

Mary M. Schaefer

In early Rome no official papal Mass was appointed for the Sunday following Pentecost Sunday; it was left “vacant” because of the demanding regimen of the preceding Saturday, when ordinations were conducted. Then, in the early seventh century when Rome was heavily influenced by Byzantine practices, the first Sunday following Whitsun was observed as a “Sunday of the Saints.” North of the Alps, however, the practice had developed of celebrating All Saints’ Day on November 1, as part of the sanctoral rather than the temporal cycle. Rome accepted this northern practice during the pontificate of Gregory IV (827-844), and the Sunday after Pentecost again became vacant.

Only in 1334: Most of the materials for the Proper of Trinity Sunday had been developed north of the Alps during the eighth century, although the preface of the Holy Trinity had a Roman origin, and perhaps was influenced by Pope Leo the Great (440-461). (In the post-Tridentine Latin Mass this preface was used on all Sundays which did not have their own proper preface.) The church of Rome resisted introducing the northern feast of the Trinity until in 1334 Pope John XXII, resident in Avignon, extended it to the entire church.¹

A feast of doctrine: In recent years Trinity Sunday has been criticized as an “idea” feast: that is, it does not celebrate an event of salvation history but instead holds up to Christian view a doctrine, albeit the foundational Christian dogma. When Trinity Sunday is approached from the perspective of a doctrine to be taught and a mystery to be explicated (of course it can hardly be explained), preachers may well find themselves stammering for words.

The Roman Missal of 1570

Not trinitarian: The Roman Missal of Pius V, in force from 1570 until 1970, used brief scripture readings which lent themselves to a thematic rather than a salvation history treatment. The epistle invited awestruck adoration but gave no inkling of the triune nature of the Godhead:

O the depth of the riches of the wisdom and of the knowledge of God! How incomprehensible are His judgements, and how unsearchable His ways! For who hath known the mind of the Lord? Or who hath been His counselor? Or who hath first given to Him, and recompense shall be made Him? For of Him, and by Him, and in Him, are all things: to Him be glory for ever. Amen. (Romans 11.33-36)

The Western starting point, the unity of the divine essence, is supported by this series of exclamations.

**The gospel** prior to Vatican II was short:

> At that time, Jesus said to His disciples, All power is given to Me in heaven and in earth. Going, therefore, teach all nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Ghost. Teaching them to observe all things whatsoever I have commanded you; and behold I am with you all days, even to the consummation of the world.  
> (Matthew 28:18-20)

**The inner divine life:** These verses, doubtless witnessing to the interrogatory baptismal formula in use in Matthew’s church, were chosen for Trinity Sunday because they name the three Persons in their inner divine life. This naming does not follow the “economic” mode typical of liturgy, but the “immanent” mode characteristic of doctrinal statements, where inner-trinitarian relations are to the fore. Because of the reading’s brevity, the ascending Lord’s baptismal mandate to be carried out during the time of the church and his promise to be with his disciples until the end of time are not placed within an anthropological and historical context. Hence this passage might be taken in an exclusivist sense, as a dispensation of powers to those who are the official teachers and sacramental ministers in the church. Today, hearers of this gospel might well ask: What good news does that message hold for us now, in our daily lives of faith?

**Lectionary of 1970**

**More trinitarian:** When, following the directives of Vatican Council II, the Sunday Mass Lectionary was revised, a noticeable change was made in the choice and content of the readings. The new readings are not less theological, but they are more trinitarian. They make plain that God, origin of all things, is FOR us; that God Emmanuel is WITH us, and that God’s Holy Spirit is IN us. For they retell the narrative of God’s triune missions in the economy of salvation while indicating too the human response which God invites. When proclaimed with understanding and vigour, the three readings in each cycle encapsulate the story of God’s triune relationships with humanity.

- **Year of Matthew (Year A)**
  Exodus 34.4b-6, 8-9
  2 Corinthians 13.11-13
  John 3.16-18

- **Year of Mark (Year B)**
  Deuteronomy 4.32-34, 39-40
  Romans 8.14-17
  Matthew 28.16-20

- **Year of Luke (Year C)**
  Proverbs 8.22-31
  Romans 5.1-5
  John 16.12-15
In each set of readings a similar pattern is discernible. In the Hebrew Scriptures God reveals self by acting in a mighty and marvelous way to save this elect people. In turn, the people are invited to recognize God's favour and to respond as God's very own. The beautiful reading from the book of Proverbs (Year C) shows the personified figure of Wisdom working beside God in creation. In the trinitarian controversies of the fourth century these verses occasioned much debate. As the passage was often applied to Christ the Wisdom of God, did this not support the Arian contention that the Son of God was created rather than eternally existent? After orthodox interpretation began to apply this passage to the Word incarnate rather than to the preexistent Christ, it could speak eloquently to the Word's integral part in creation: see also John 1.3, Colossians 1.15-17, and Hebrews 1.2.

Human life and the Trinity: In each set of readings the epistle deals with the life of faith as modeled on that of the Trinity. The second reading for Year A is a particularly eloquent appeal for that communion of loving human interrelationships which is a reflection of the inner trinitarian life. Verse 13 is one of the greetings used, immediately following the Sign of the Cross, to begin the Mass. Verse 12 alludes to the kiss of peace which is a frequent reference at the end of Paul's letters. In the mid-second century, as reported by Justin Martyr, it concluded the Liturgy of the Word in Rome; now, following immediately the Lord's Prayer, it forms an integral part of the communion rite.

What the Trinity does for us: The epistle for Year B teaches us about the Trinity by what the Trinity does for us: God is our Abba (that special term of endearment used by Jesus), Christ is our brother who has earned us an inheritance, and the Spirit witnesses that we are God's children. In Year C the blessings bestowed by the triune God at work in our midst are set out. We are assured of reconciliation with God through our mediator Jesus; we have received the outpouring of God's love through the Spirit; and the activity of that Holy Spirit leads us to a supernatural faith which makes possible a life of hope and patient endurance despite trials.

Of the gospels for Trinity Sunday only the first, Jesus' revelation to Nicodemus, "God so loved the world..." (John 3.16-18) fails to refer to all three persons. Yet here the centrality of faith in the gift of salvation points to the Holy Spirit who, with Christ, is sharing source of faith in Christians, and without whom persons could not come to belief or be maintained in it. In Year B the Matthean baptismal mandate and promise are set in a context of the eleven disciples' human reaction to Jesus on his departure from them: some adored, some doubted. Against this perennial scenario of human fidelity and weakness Christ's assurance to be with his followers -- indeed, to be with them in the new and more intense way not possible before his death and resurrection -- is indeed comforting.

The remarkable gospel for Year C (Jesus' promise to send the Spirit) invites believers to contemplate and enter into the life of the Trinity, where the three persons interrelate in a perfect communion of giving to and receiving from one other.²

² See the excellent article by C. M. LaCugna, "Making the Most of Trinity Sunday," Worship 60 (May 1986) 210-224, with exegetical notes on the three cycles of readings.
Solemnities of the Lord

The Sacramentary and the Lectionary group together immediately following Pentecost Sunday the following "solemnities of the Lord": Trinity Sunday, the Body and Blood of Christ, the Sacred Heart of Jesus. These three "idea" feasts have a devotional rather than salvation history content; they stand outside the normal course of the liturgical year.

Jesus Christ reveals God: Why is Trinity Sunday included among the "solemnities of the Lord (Jesus)"? It is Jesus Christ who reveals God: "God ... has shone in our hearts to give the light of the knowledge of the glory of God in the face of Jesus Christ" (2 Corinthians 4.6). The risen Jesus, possessing all that the Father has, sends that Spirit who, during the course of Jesus' life, has taken on the "shape" or impress of Jesus. Therefore, Jesus Christ, "image of the invisible God" (Colossians 1.15) is our entrée to both the Father and the Spirit.

Developing New Liturgies Which Symbolize the Trinitarian Community

Too familiar? The "idea feast" of Trinity Sunday provides an opportunity to bring a sublime dogma "down to earth" – to savour its meaning for and concrete application to the faith lived by persons who make up specific assemblies in particular cultures. The revised Lectionary gives us scope to speak about the three persons as active in our lives of faith and love, and in our world. However, it is important to not only speak about but also to enact and symbolize the truths of our faith. Of course the church's prayer and its official liturgies are trinitarian. Sometimes, however, what is treasured has become too familiar and we hardly attend to it. Moreover, not all sacramental rituals revised since 1970 give equal place to an explicitly trinitarian structure and theology.

Without reflection? Moreover, since liturgy is ritualized behaviour, ecclesial communities frequently continue without reflection ways of configuring themselves and acting which are characteristic of a juridical or christomonistic – but not a trinitarian – theology of the church.³

Sometimes a special occasion presents an opportunity to develop a liturgy which does not follow the usual structure found in the regular parish liturgies of Word and Eucharist. Reflection on the trinitarian relations, and drawing out the implications for how humans act and interact in faithfulness to the triune God, can lead to a new and even surprising liturgical experience of mutuality. The common priesthood of all those who have been baptized into Christ and anointed with the Holy Spirit in confirmation is the theological grounds for proceeding with such a project, and might also contribute to the theme.

A planning process: With a planning group, begin by drawing a simple diagram (or diagrams – there may be more than one model) which represents your community’s understanding of the Trinity. Of course it is important that this image not contain elements contrary to Christian tradition. But trust the instinct of the faith (sensus fidei), while remaining open to correction.

Seating and furniture: Next, consider how best to configure the assembly so that it might experience its corporate and personal faith-life as founded on the Trinity. Does this proposed configuration represent the equality of Persons with differences of functions, bound together by the dynamism of creative love and energy? Does the design enhance the experience of mutuality in community and shared prayer?

Select readings which will allow persons to understand and share the manifold ways that God, Word and Spirit are at work, in the lives of individuals and corporately, within the whole economy of salvation or focusing on one aspect of it. Take the proclamation and sharing of the Word so seriously that all can hear with a new understanding.

What music and hymnody will contribute to configuration and theme? Where will there be silence? How much music and silence is appropriate? What about movement – and by whom?

Symbol and leadership: Then incorporate an appropriate symbolic action into your liturgy, one which can represent, however simply, the trinitarian life. Further questions include: Who will be the leaders? From what location will they contribute their gifts? How will the sharing and dynamic interaction of the trinitarian life be symbolized?

Celebrate the liturgy: Be attentive and open to the various and different ways by which God, Word and Holy Spirit are actively present in the midst of believers.

Finally, reflect on the celebration with the planning group and whoever else wishes to contribute. Would you do it again? What would you keep? What would you change? On the basis of this experience can you make any suggestions for the way your parish might carry out its regular liturgical celebrations?
Inclusive language: At the level of popular ecclesial discourse, probably the most active area in trinitarian theology since 1975, has been discussion of the names we give to God and whether we take care to name all human beings, made in God’s image and likeness, in our language of faith, prayer and sung praise. Popular pronunciation and public debate in secular as well as religious media over the reasons for and implications of inclusive language for people have yet to wane.

Differences of opinion: We can therefore be forgiven for presuming that some questions about trinitarian language seem to pose intractable difficulties. After all, trinitarian language attempts to point to and symbolize Holy Mystery itself. Despite a convergence of opinions and even resolution of some issues, strong differences of position remain. The remarkable endurance of questions about God-language (a theme which arose shortly after God was declared dead) suggests that the topic bears greater theological weight than was first conceded.

Still in process: It is not yet clear even to those who claim a centrist position that a “God-language” fully satisfactory from the theological as well as anthropological perspectives has been found. The functional categories of Creator, Redeemer and Sustainer, describe God’s unitive activity in the economy; they do not correlate with the distinction of persons in the immanent Trinity. Even less satisfactory for Christians is the designation of God in an undifferentiated fashion as Spirit. Despite Jesus’ address to his dear Abba, naming God exclusively as Father (a characteristic of liturgical texts in the early ’70s) could – and for some has – suggested that God is a sexual being.

It is evident that more time is needed to develop and experiment with language which names God. Nor must we forget the absolute necessity of critiquing the consequences which flow from adoption of one or another strategy for the naming of God and human beings in relation if Christianity is to remain rooted in its scriptures and tradition. The language which we use in worship carries specific theological denotations (what is signified in the human social

---

1 In keeping with recently won sensitivity to racist attitudes in the mid-seventies, publishers’ protocols began to require the use of what is now termed “inclusive” language. This was a period of massive liturgical revision in many churches. But new biblical translations and catechetical materials had just adopted the principle, in analogy with semitic narrative imagery, that the language of faith should be concrete rather than abstract. A wealth of gender-specific language, quite outdoing the bible itself and even exceeding that sanctioned by older English grammatical rules, was abroad and in use in the new vernacular liturgies and hymnody. Scripture and liturgy appeared to sanction unjust practice! Hence the sometimes acrimonious debates.
sphere) and connotations (what is signified at the level of the mystery). The language of public worship has need for more formality and traditional references than does that of a semi-private gathering of an homogeneous group. The former must not only have broader currency at the “horizontal” social level because of those participating in the ecclesial celebration; it must also appeal to the apostolic witness handed down in the scriptures.

**Language has changed:** Nevertheless, those who would claim that liturgical language – including that for God – has been unchanging, always like that found in the prayer books of our youth, simply have no knowledge of historical liturgical texts. They are ignorant of, for instance, the Gallican and Mozarabic rites of the Western church. They are uninformed of the metaphorical flights of language found in eucharistic anaphoras of churches of the East. Their spirits have not been moved by the Christian mystical traditions of East or West. These persons are more to be pitied than censured.

**Liturgical language must be “open” language,** speech which invites people in as participants rather than turns them away experiencing the heartbreak of exclusion. Within our own Roman tradition during the early Middle Ages language referring to people – in the Latin tongue – tended to be more inclusive of the actual members of the assembly than vernacular translations of the middle years of the 20th century.

**We should be asking:** How can the language we use in liturgy open us as a celebrating community toward that future which is being shaped even now by the Spirit and from which the Lord of the church comes to meet us? How can our language express that we, a people who are heirs of a sinful past and are still closed against many around us, yearn to participate in the eschaton, the promised endtimes – and already enjoy a foretaste of its joy and communion?

**God and Jesus:** Still discomfiting to some Western Christians is the New Testament witness which refers to God in contradistinction to Jesus Christ. Of course the excessively florid growth of devotion to the Blessed Virgin and to the saints which accompanied the demise of liturgical participation was tied also to the practical denial or at least downplaying of Jesus’ humanity and the intercessory role consequent on that. If Nicaea gained for Jesus Christ the Christian confession that the Crucified was “of the same stuff” as the Father, nevertheless his humanity needed (and still needs) always to be maintained alongside his divinity. This is why the recovery of “ascending christology” or “christology from below” is so important for liturgy.

**Two hands of God:** We hear the normative witness of the Christian scriptures behind the trinitarian language used by St. Irenaeus of Lyons, who referred to God, Word and Spirit, the latter as God’s two hands at work in the world.

**Medieval mystics:** The mystical tradition provides many a witness. Current favorites include St. Hildegard of Bingen (1089-1179), St. Mechtild of Magdeburg (1207-1294), and Julian of Norwich (born 1342), who with the perfect comfort

---

of an intimate friend of God mixed masculine, feminine and inclusive names and images for all three persons of the Trinity.3

Patristic testimony: The strong and at times disconcerting disputes which believers have engaged in have not always been based on the soundest knowledge of classical trinitarian doctrines. Listen, for instance, to Saint Gregory of Nyssa (c. 335 - c. 395), one of the three Cappadocian fathers who played a major role in the formulation of trinitarian doctrine:

. . . following the instructions of the Holy Scriptures, we have been taught that the nature of God is beyond names and human speech. We say that every divine name, be it invented by human custom or handed on to us by the tradition of the Scriptures, represents our conceptions of the divine nature, but does not convey the meaning of that nature itself.4

The Eastern churches, in keeping with their "monarchian" model in which God, unoriginate source, begets the Word, and through whom in turn the Spirit proceeds, have maintained a finer sense of the mystery, transcendence and "incomprehensibility" of God than has the West (outside of the mystical tradition). The latter has sometimes thought itself capable of expressing the mystery of God within metaphysical categories.

The danger of literalism: In a now classic article, Elizabeth A. Johnson notes the comment of Hans Urs von Balthasar, that interpretation of revelation in some traditions "has in fact given rise to the 'dangerous situation' in which the need to preach and interpret has resulted in words becoming too clear and ideas too distinct, almost as if they were direct transcripts of divine reality."5 Since both women and men are created in the image and likeness of God, Johnson goes on to develop the consequences of Genesis 1.27 and Galatians 3.28 for our assumptions about and imaging of God.

Any language limps when used of the Trinity. For instance, of the word "persons" applied to the Trinity Catherine LaCugna suggests, "It would be more correct for us to say that God is a person who manifests him/herself in three distinct ways."6 Without forsaking the traditional language of Father, Son and Spirit, LaCugna asserts its relativity: "to equate divine paternity with masculinity is unreflectively literal. There is every theological (and now cultural) reason to use both pronouns when calling God Father . . . . Likewise, the Holy Spirit is not female any more than the Father is male."7

Limits of God-language: Thanks to the popular discourse about language which bears a certain parallel with fourth century christological and pneumatological controversies (albeit having an anthropological starting point in our

---

3 See also the Cistercian tradition and its abbots: Caroline Walker Bynum, Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High Middle Ages (Berkeley: University of California Press 1982).


day), a multitude of Christians now share a deepened understanding of important elements of the doctrine of God: that in God there is no gender, that language has a relative value and at best our names for God carry a metaphorical truth, that the nature of God lies at an infinite distance beyond our categories all the while that God willingly remains immanent to and implicated in our lives and world. Christians also better understand that how we name God is related to how we live and relate to one another in the world. Names for God impact on roles for people.

These are important theological gains. The years ahead should see a rich yield and some resolution of the many practical problems we face in addressing and talking about God. Meanwhile, poets, writers and composers — and yes, pray-ers — forge new modes of address to God and sensitivity to those who, in their persons of different colour, gender and age, all bear God's image and likeness.

* See especially Canadian Conference of Catholic Bishops, *Workshops on Inclusive Language* (Ottawa: CCCB 1990)
The Trinity and Creation

Mary M. Schaefer

God-In-Godself ("Immanent" Trinity)

"In the name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Spirit." One name, three persons, called on as we begin and end either personal or communal prayer, at the same time that we encompass our bodies with the cross, sign of our salvation. So simply and so repeatedly, from childhood to death, do Catholic Christians name the Triune Name.

God-At-Work-For-And-In-The-World ("Economic" Trinity)

Everything that we know about the Trinity-in-and-with-Itself is learned "at God's knee," from God's work in the world, through Christ in the power of the Holy Spirit. God reveals Self as Three-Personed in the economy (from the Greek oikonomia, referring to God's saving work in the world.)

"The grace of the Lord Jesus Christ, the love of God, and the sharing in the Holy Spirit be with all of you" (2 Corinthians 13.13). The novelty of the Christian scriptures is their presumption that the one God of the Hebrew revelation is Three-personed. They speak of a living experience of interaction with this God. Jewish monotheism (belief in one God) is maintained but enriched: not three gods ('tritheism') but three Persons in one God. Moreover, this is a God who dwells with us in a hitherto unimaginable way, who "has pitched his tent" with humans by taking on human flesh (John 1.14).

The God of Jesus Christ

Transcendence: The earliest Christian faith, like that of the Jews, acknowledges the person and work of ho theos, the unique God, the radically other (transcendent) One. The God of Abraham and Sarah, Isaac and Rebecca, though transcendent, is close to and familiar with the chosen people in their unfolding history, and intervenes in a variety of ways in their lives. At decisive junctures God summons chosen messengers to mountaintop meetings. Moses

1 Alternate reading to "the communion of" (New Revised Standard Version), chosen to emphasize the nearness of God to us in the Holy Spirit. Of course "communion" means sharing or participation in something. Most often applied to reception of the sacrament of Christ's Body and Blood, "communion" refers generically to the level of most intimate human communication. In addition, "communion ecclesiology" is a theological term applied to a particular way of "being" church, where each person and each local church is understood as having gifts to give and gifts to receive in building up the body.

and Elijah encounter the transcendent God there, although they do not see the Holy One with their bodily eyes. In this holy encounter they are changed. Moses’ face glows when he comes down from the mountain; the people cannot look on it for its shining (Exodus 34.29-35).

Jesus Christ, God’s Only-Begotten Son

**Jesus reveals God:** With this one “God of our ancestors” (see Acts 3.13 and Hebrews 1.1), Jesus of Nazareth has a special relationship. In the gospel of John, although not exclusively there, this relationship is spelled out as uniquely intimate: Jesus calls God “my Father,” and in turn is denominated “my Son.” “The Father and I are one,” Jesus exclaims (John 10.30). It is the work of Jesus to reveal God. He prays to God and expects to be answered. When pressed by his followers for a method of prayer, Jesus teaches them to pray “our Father in heaven” (Matthew 6.9). But he does not put their relation to this Father on an equal footing with his. The Beloved Son is uniquely related to the Father; speaking with Mary of Magdala he distinguishes between “my Father and your father, . . . my God and your God” (John 20.17).

**A special relationship:** High points of Jesus’ life show that he experienced and claimed a relationship to God unlike and more intimate than that of any other human being. In the annunciation to Mary and his conception this special relationship was demonstrated. At his baptism; at those transparent times during his ministry when he addresses God in public (e.g., certain of the miracles; the blessing of the children); in the garden of Gethsemane and finally, in the great cry of abandonment as he dies on the cross (Mark 15.34), Jesus manifests an intimacy with God which, if not authentic, would represent a blasphemous claim.

Spirit of God, Spirit of Christ

**Sanctifying power:** In both Hebrew and Christian scriptures the Spirit of God has a profile singularly distinct from Father and Son and yet bears their impress. “The wind blows where it chooses, and you hear the sound of it, but you do not know where it comes from or where it goes” (John 3.8). Without a proper name or even a proper pronoun, this Spirit is the sanctifying power and the wisdom of God. The Spirit comes from the Father (John 14.26) but is also sent by the risen Christ (John 20.22). Everywhere the Spirit is at work returning all creation to its maker.

The Mystery of the Trinity

**Mystery?** Yes, the Christian doctrine of the Trinity is a great mystery. From early times Christians of the East and West approached the mystery from opposite starting points; for many centuries they have been hard put to understand each other, each thinking that their way was the only way to express the mystery. The doctrine speaks to human beings created in God’s image and likeness (Genesis 1.26), of the divine, dynamic and everlasting life which God wants and wills to share. In the face of this doctrine we should be curious and fascinated, moved to wonder and praise, and seeking to shape our lives and ways of being in the world to conform to the triune God’s.
An ocean: Seeking feeble analogies for the human experience of God, mystical traditions including the Christian have not infrequently resorted to the metaphor of the ocean. A recent composition in a Mass format utilizes creation and Celtic themes in the person-to-person dialogue characteristic of prayer. The religious mystery of personal encounter between the immensity of God and created being is supported by the Mass structure and trinitarian allusions:

Oh strangely glorious and beautiful sea!
Sounding forever mysteriously . . . (Kyrie)

Glory be to Thee, O God of life,
Maker of wond’rous works.
Great bright heaven with its angels,
The white-waved sea on earth . . . (Gloria)

I arise today
Through a mighty strength,
The invocation of the Trinity,
Through the belief in the threeness,
Through the confession of the oneness,
Of the Creator of Creation . . . (Credo)

God in mine ever-living soul,
God in my eternity. (Agnus Dei)3

"In the beginning when God created the heavens and the earth, the earth was a formless void and darkness covered the face of the deep, while a wind from God swept over the face of the waters" (Genesis 1.1-2). Those who have played in and by the sea, whose minds and senses have been intoxicated by the sea's rhythms, understand how aptly the mystical tradition thinks of God as an ocean. Those who have prayed with and "listened" to the rhythms of liturgy, especially the liturgy after Vatican Council II, know that, as with the early Irish, the trinitarian mystery is often on the lips and in the heart.

An Exercise in Appreciative Consciousness

To "think" Trinity it is necessary to do some stretching exercises: of the imagination, of the emotions and senses, of wonder and appreciative consciousness.

On a cloudless, moonless August night, at some distance if it can be managed from city lights, gaze directly overhead: in the northern hemisphere a constellation of three stars forms a discernible triangle around which the heavens seem to rotate. The starry pathway of the Milky Way leads off into other galaxies. What we can see of the heavens with the naked eye — or even with a high-powered telescope — represents only a fraction of the solar system in which Planet Earth spins on its poles. Human beings have been cheeky enough to imagine that they, and their world, are the center of this orderly, mysterious cosmos.

3 See the Kyrie, Gloria, Credo and Agnus Dei in the "Celtic Mass for the Sea," composed by Scott MacMillan; CBC 1991. The trinitarian confession is taken from the eighth century "Deer's Cry," often referred to as the "Breastplate of St. Patrick."
We are mystery: Similarly, what minute worlds a microscope reveals as existing ready at hand and under our noses. Mystery surrounds us; we live in its midst. Not only that. We as persons are incomprehensible mystery to one another, even to those who know and love us best.

Time, Incalculable and Beyond Comprehension

As human inhabitants of Planet Earth, our experience is limited to a particular moment in the ongoing history of this universe, a moment different from any other yet related to all the others. We had nothing to do with choosing the time in which we would live, just as we had nothing to do with the place or circumstances into which we were born. Multiply the space we have imaginatively placed ourselves in by the times before and after our brief and uncertain stay: by the aeons of time which brought our universe and the things which comprise its core and live on its surface to their present state. This exercise in imagination and multiplication leaves us with finite answers to questions stammering for expression.

God is not to be found at the outermost perimeters of space or boundaries of time. None of our observations allows us to touch God. God inhabits another dimension, that of ultimate and holy Mystery, which is accessible only to those who seek on God's terms. God is to be touched only through the personal relationship of intimacy: love.

Tri-unity

Now we must try to imagine Tri-unity in infinity. Beyond the farthest reaches of the cosmos, but embracing it in their vibrant life, imagine Three: God the source of all life, the One who originates; God the Word spoken, who receives all personhood from the Origin. One is unoriginated Origin, One is Only-begotten. Interpenetrating and interpenetrated, each turns toward the other as each reaches toward the other in love. They are bound together across infinity by the Third, the Spirit, equal to them in divinity, their mutual bond and the spiration of their love. The "immanent" indwelling Trinity has a fullness of abundant life, needs nothing else.

Vibrant life: Now imagine, if you can, something of the dynamism which animates these three Persons who know one another, love one another fully with an infinite knowledge and love. Their vibrant life overflows, seeking to extend itself. Three-in-One, it pours itself out (in kenosis, self-emptying) and the world is created. God the originating Source creates all things through the Word (Hebrews 1.2b), while the Spirit of God hovers lovingly over the new life (see Genesis 1.2b). By stages, respecting the laws of change and growth embedded in the molecules and genes and histories of all living things, the Creator-God forms the earth and a people to inhabit it.

The Word, at work from the beginning, has the mission of entering into full solidarity with humanity by taking on flesh as Emmanuel (God-with-us) in order to lead to God those made in God's image and likeness. Involved from the beginning, the Spirit's special mission is to be "in" the world to make it holy, to be on the side of human beings to draw them and all creatures to their Creator. The "economic" Trinity implodes, from its positions of infinity and eternity, to create and to re-create.
Bridegroom and bride: The first chapter of Genesis is illumined by the first chapter of John’s gospel, while the last book of the bible, fittingly called “the Revelation of Jesus Christ,” concludes with the vision of the new Jerusalem coming down out of heaven, its temple the Lord God and the Lamb. In the yearning dialogue of bridegroom and bride are promise and invitation, not to a distant galaxy away in the heavens, but to a new creation where God dwells with mortals: “See, I am coming soon” . . . . The Spirit and the bride say, “Come” . . . . “Surely I am coming soon” . . . . “Amen. Come, Lord Jesus!” (Revelation 22:12, 17, 20). God is impatient. The Spirit and the bride are impatient. All creation groans with the pangs of labour (Romans 8.22). At last the transcendent God is fully immanent – which, applied to God, means permanently pervading the universe!
The one Creator God who cradles and orders the cosmos in all its immensity, diversity, and change is the same God who is personally present and active in human history. How is that presence experienced? This God who existed prior to all created things and from all eternity stoops down to the world to save it. "[God] will come and save you" (Isaiah 35.4). God acts through the Word (Dabar) and the Breath or Spirit (Ruah), which in the Old Testament seem to be extensions in the world of the transcendent God.

Jesus' Abba: The Old Testament's hard-won monotheism is superseded and perfected in the New by the claim of the carpenter of Nazareth. Jesus receives everything from his Abba in heaven, toward whose kingdom-project he is totally dedicated. The one God is his "Father"; the two know a special relationship which makes them one in being and yet distinct as "persons" or centers of consciousness: "I am in the Father and the Father is in me" (John 14.11). What is revealed in how God works in the world (economic Trinity) is true in the immanent Trinity: turned toward each other in love, Father and Son exchange a transcendent mutual love which issues or "proceeds" in a third person, their irrevocable bond, the Spirit.

The over-brimming love of God flows out in the "missions" of Son and Spirit to the created world; they undertake the work of shepherd and caregiver. Their goal is nothing short of a new creation: enabling all creatures to achieve their full potential by giving God the glory.

God will be glorified in the work fashioned by him, when he has made it resemble and conform to his Son. For, by the hands of the Father, that is, through the Son and the Spirit, the human being is made into the image and likeness of God.¹

Jesus promises to send the Spirit: The Son, "image of the unseen God" (Colossians 1.15), willingly accepts from the Father this mission. "The true light, which enlightens everyone, was coming into the world... the Word became flesh and lived among us" (John 1.9, 14). When Jesus' mission and his very person are rejected and he senses that death is near, he says farewell to his disciple-friends. He promises to send the Spirit-Paraclete: the Spirit who comes from the Father and constitutes Jesus' mutual bond with the Father (John 14.16, 26; 15.26).

¹ Irenaeus of Lyons, Against Heresies, 6.1, in Irénée de Lyon, Contre les hérésies V, pt. 2 (Sources chrétiennes 153; Paris: Les Editions du Cerf 1969) 72-73
The Son remains true to the mission he has received through to its bitter end on the cross. Self-communication involves self-giving: God's very self is poured out as gift. Even when bowing his head in death the divine Son manifests the glory which is his from God. John's gospel is illumined by the light cast by eternity.

The Word's kenosis, self-emptying, forms the content of the early Christian hymn found in Philippians 2.5-11:

> Let the same mind be in you that was in Christ Jesus,
> who, though he was in the form of God,
> did not regard equality with God
> as something to be exploited,
> but emptied himself,
> taking the form of a slave,
> being born in human likeness . . . .

What has been said above illustrates "descending" or "Logos" christology. That is, an explanation of Jesus Christ is provided by moving from the divinity to the humanity of Christ. God descends in the divine Word, pure utterance of the Father, to become truly incarnate in the person Jesus. Although Jesus is subject to all the uncertainties and disabilities of concrete human existence, in this explanation Jesus' divine personhood (the Word or Logos) is to the fore. Until the late fourth century and the development of a full theology of the Holy Spirit, references in scripture to the Holy Spirit are often understood of the Logos. For example, the Logos acts to take on human nature. Many Christians today understand Jesus Christ almost entirely in terms of Logos christology.

Ascending or Spirit Christology

The Philippians text cited above shifts from a descending to an ascending movement:

> Therefore God highly exalted him
> and gave him the name that is above every name,
> so that at the name of Jesus every knee should bend . . . .

The God who obediently took the form of a slave to be in solidarity with humanity is exalted as Lord and qualified to receive adoration. His sisters and brothers of every age are qualified to enter into that "sharing in the Spirit" (Philippians 2.1) issuing in the joyous life of praise and thanksgiving which is that of Christ Jesus, "to the glory of God the Father."

In "ascending" or "Spirit" christology the work of the Spirit as divine agent is to the fore. We can come to an understanding of the ancient Spirit christology by asking:

- How was the Spirit active in Jesus' life?
- What was the place of liturgy in Jesus' life?

---

1 The Fathers of the early church emphasized that the divine Word assumed human nature. Even though this nature was concretized in a person of the male gender, who belonged to one race and nation and era and not another (the "scandal of particularity"), councils, bishops and writers did not hold up any of these secondary characteristics as notable or normative. Nor should we.
• What does Spirit christology contribute to appreciation of the action of the Trinity in our own faith journey? What are we called to become?

The answers to these questions impinge on the personal spirituality of Christians and form the inner content of liturgical prayer. Some of the scriptural data are outlined below.

How Was the Spirit Active in Jesus’ Life?

The human Jesus: Starting from the human in the order of logical (not temporal) priority, the humanity of Jesus is “anointed” by the Spirit in Mary’s womb and united with the person of the Word. The human way things happen, in this case the human process of conception and birth, is highlighted. “The Holy Spirit will come upon you, and the power of the Most High will overshadow you; therefore the child to be born will be holy; he will be called Son of God” (Luke 1.34-35).

The baptism of Jesus in the Jordan shows how the Spirit sent from the Father led Jesus to a new understanding of his mission. The synoptic gospels (Matthew, Mark and Luke) tend to show Jesus from the human side; for Luke especially, Jesus’ ministry is imbued with the Spirit. Peter’s sermons as presented in Acts of the Apostles (e.g., 10.38) presume a “christology from below,” as does the passage from the Letter to the Hebrews (5.7) read on Good Friday: “In the days of his flesh, Jesus offered up prayers and supplications, with loud cries and tears, to the one who was able to save him from death”.

As the passion approaches “the Spirit strengthens Jesus especially that he will not lose heart.” He is able to endure “refusal, failure and defeat” thanks to the Spirit. As Jesus bears the full weight of the world’s sin, as his faith is tested to full measure, the Spirit preserves the mutual bond between a Father who seems to be absent and a Son who is on the side of sinners. Jesus hands over his spirit to God (John 19.30), and gives over his failed mission to the Spirit.

Obedient to death, Jesus is raised by the Father to glory. Now the risen Christ, become a life-giving spirit (1 Corinthians 15.45), actively sends the Spirit.

For us: From this brief sketch of the power of the Holy Spirit in the life of Jesus we can take heart. Even though the incarnate Word possessed the fullness of the Spirit from the moment of conception, the Spirit’s power obeyed the laws of human growth and maturation, leading Jesus to ever new ways of doing God’s work and giving God the glory. Risen, he “gives the Spirit without measure” (John 3.34).

What Was the Place of Liturgy in Jesus’ Life?

A privileged time for discovery: In the presentation of the infant Jesus in the temple (Luke 2.22-38), Simeon and Anna were moved by the Spirit to recognize the import of this child. The boy Jesus, as shown by the episode of his

3 This section is indebted especially to the work of David Coffey, Jean Corbon and Edward Kilmartin (see bibliography). The theme of the faith of Christ and its consequences for the Christian life is spelled out in Edward Kilmartin, Culture and the Praying Church. Canadian Studies in Liturgy 5 (Ottawa: CCCB 1990) 81ff.

teaching in the temple, is given insight into the mysteries of God (Luke 2.41-47).
In the synagogue at Nazareth Jesus reads in the scroll the prophecy of his own
ministry and its driving force: "The Spirit of the Lord is upon me" (Luke 4.14-22;
Isaiah 61.1-2). The liturgy, along with and supported by the private prayer which
Jesus cherished, was a privileged time for the discovery — by Jesus and by others
— of God's plans for his own life.

What Does Spirit Christology Contribute to an
Appreciation of the Action of the Trinity in
Our Own Faith Journey?

Ancient Spirit christology, newly appreciated, is especially important for
Christians today because it shows us the full possibility of human life. It explains
how sacramental life nourishes Christian life. In showing how the Spirit acted in
Jesus in new and surprising ways at decisive turning-points in his life and Jesus’
human response, we can recognize the ways God's Holy Spirit acts in and over
believers in their lives of faith to turn them toward encounter with God.

Baptism: As Jesus the dearly-loved Son accepted his vocation to be God’s
Servant at the baptism in the Jordan, so are we strengthened to accept our bap-
tsimal call. At each stage of his life Jesus obeyed the impulses of the Spirit; so
we, as adopted children of God, are invited to do the same. This is how we grow
in the Christian life. Lives of witness, service and worship for which the sacra-
ments of initiation equip us are the outcome of the power of God's Holy Spirit
working in us.

The Trinity and Liturgy

Jesus and the Spirit: It should now be clear why it is useful and even necessary
to introduce technical concepts like descending and ascending christology into
our theme, Trinitarian Dimensions of Liturgy. Thanks to descending christology
we can see that Jesus is the only one who is so imbued with the Spirit, which
bears his impress, that he can give it to others. Jesus does give the Spirit to those
who believe; this is the Spirit which makes us adopted children of God (Romans
8.15; Galatians 4.5) and energizes us. This Spirit enables the risen Christ to be
experienced as living and actively present in the faith community in its variety of
manifestations of faith. Thus Christians are empowered to enter into that move-
ment of return to God (cf. ascending christology) which was accomplished by
Jesus the pioneer and pattern of our faith.

Dynamics of the liturgy: Awareness of these distinctive “movements” helps us
to understand the dynamics of the liturgy as the church's prayer to God offered
through Christ in the Holy Spirit and how we, by entering into liturgical prayer and
sacramental action, are incorporated into God’s saving plan.

Relates to our lives: Descending and ascending christology helps us to under-
stand that good liturgy is above all “realistic.” That is, it relates to what is really
happening in people's lives and in their world; it brings to the foreground what is
given to us to accept as gift from God and to celebrate. Authentic liturgy does not

---

(1992) 57-95
turn away from humbling falls from fortune or even the most profound heartbreak and tragedy, whether in personal, social or institutional life. It celebrates life and faces it head-on, acknowledging both the joyous successes and the humiliating failures – and invoking God's blessing as we live our lives from birth to death walking in Christ's footsteps empowered by the Spirit of God. Good sacramental liturgy puts us in contact with the Christ who has gone before us and now is actively present with us in unparalleled intimacy. It calls us as community to new ways of being and doing justice in view of the kingdom. In a disoriented world honest liturgy offers deep insight into life's meaning.

Liturgy's Purpose

**Say Yes:** The purpose of liturgy is to help people of faith face life's "mystery": the daily round, their special tasks, and the invitation to enter, each in his or her unique way, into the profound depths of the mystery of Christ's suffering, dying, rising and ascending to God's right hand. It offers them the words, the sentiments, the pattern, the will to say "Yes" to God in union with our mediator Jesus, high priest of the church's worship, enabled by that transcendent Gift who is the Spirit.

In [Christ] it is always "Yes." For in him every one of God's promises is a "Yes." For this reason it is through him that we say the "Amen," to the glory of God. But it is God who establishes us with you in Christ and has anointed us, by putting his seal on us and giving us his Spirit in our hearts as a first installment. (2 Corinthians 1.19b-22)

Note how Paul holds up Christ as the pattern of our response and the Holy Spirit as enabler. In our daily lives we are surrounded by the company of the Trinity.

The Community of Trinity

**Approach God on tiptoe:** To presume that human beings can enter immediately as full-fledged partners into the egalitarian, dynamic, exuberant life of God-in-Trinity is to deny, not only the reality of life around us, but as well the experience and testimony of world religions, where the mystery of God is recognized as both awe-inspiring and fascinatingly attractive (mysterium tremendum et fascinans). Human beings who have some knowledge of God approach barefoot and on tiptoe, carrying their shoes (Isaiah 6). Those friends of God, the mystics, experienced their nothingness – yes, even trumpeted their sinfulness – in the face of encounter with the all-holy God.

**Our humanity is honoured:** If the triune God yearns to draw us into the divine community, the project is carried forward for God's beloved daughters and sons following the pattern of the beloved Son. God takes our humanity seriously. God the Father has poured self out in creative and redemptive activity; God the Son has drunk the chalice of human suffering to its dregs; God the Spirit is everywhere active to inspire, energize and bring creatures back to the divine community. Persons of faith need only enter into God's project for the world. Liturgy brings us to that consciousness, allows us to symbolize and enact God's project, and offers us the foretaste of blessedness and communion, with God and with one another.
A Profile of the Spirit
According to Scripture

Mary M. Schaefer

It is impossible to write a biography of the Holy Spirit in the usual sense of that term. It might be truer to say that the Holy Spirit continues to write its own autobiography in the persons whom it inspires, the attitudes it inculcates, and the events it underwrites.¹

A thumbnail account of the Spirit's activities as recorded in the scriptures² would need to include the following.

Old Testament

Creation: God's spirit sweeps or hovers over the waters during that great "week" of creation (Genesis 1.2). The living creature has a life-giving spirit ("breath" from God; see Genesis 7.21-22). When God takes back this spirit, human beings descend into the dust (Job 34.14-15). The Spirit is God's breath and power.

Prophets and kings: There is a "special" spirit from God, received by prophets and by kings (Isaiah 11.2).

New Testament

Incarnation and ministry: Just as the spirit of God was present at the inception of creation, so God's Holy Spirit is integrally involved in the conception of Jesus (Luke 1.35). Luke's has often been referred to as the gospel of the Holy Spirit. For Luke in particular, the Holy Spirit shapes the child Jesus and is the driving force in his ministry.

On the cross Jesus breathes out "his" Spirit (John 19.30), which has taken its shape from the innumerable "Yeses" with which the beloved Son answered his Father during the course of his life. Raised from the dead, Jesus was "vindicated by the Spirit" (1 Timothy 3.16).

¹ Just as the Spirit cannot be given a proper name but rather is described in its works by attributes, so the assigning of a pronoun is singularly difficult. The Spirit is most assuredly not he, she or it. However, see the stimulating suggestions in Yves Congar, I Believe in the Holy Spirit, vol. 3, "The Motherhood in God and the Femininity of the Holy Spirit," 155-164; consult the Annotated Bibliography for the full reference.

In the church: The Holy Spirit is not only actively present in Jesus’ own ministry but is sent by the risen Lord to the Church. Born at Pentecost, the Spirit is present in the church and can even be called its soul. The church is given Spirit-gifts for its upbuilding; the greatest of these is love (1 Corinthians 13).

Gifts of grace: Since the Spirit has such an important role to play in forming the church, the church at Thessalonica is warned, “Do not quench the Spirit . . . but test everything; hold fast to what is good” (1 Thessalonians 5.19, 21). The Spirit provides charisms, “gifts of grace,” of one kind and another, in sufficient quantity that every Christian is given a charism for the church’s upbuilding.

Presence of Christ: We should not think of the church as simply taking up or taking over where Jesus left off his ministry. The risen Lord continues to have a mission in the world through the Spirit: in the formation of the Christian community; in the power by which God’s intervention continues to be realized in the Christian community; as revealer of God’s plan and purposes; as head of the church and chief celebrant of its liturgy.

Children of God: In John the Holy Spirit is possessed by (or rather, possesses) every Christian (John 14.17, 26). The Spirit bonds the believer to God in Christ. Those who believe receive God’s Spirit of “sonship” (Paul) or childship (John). One is a child of God if one has received the Spirit of Jesus (see especially Galatians 4.6 and Romans 8.14-16). Believers have faith in Christ thanks to the Holy Spirit, who gives insight into the deep things of God (1 Corinthians 2.9-14).

Pastoral office in the church is endowed by the Spirit (1 Timothy 4.14; 2 Timothy 1.6). In Acts the Spirit works actively right alongside the apostles and disciples: “It has seemed good to the Holy Spirit and to us” (Acts 15.28).

The Spirit’s Work in Liturgy and Sacraments.

The Spirit and the word: The Spirit “anoints” the word proclaimed so that believers can respond to it in faith. The Spirit in the hearers is able to respond to the Spirit speaking in the proclamation.

Epiclesis: In an explicit prayer whose content corresponds to the sacrament in question, the church asks God to send the Sanctifying Spirit. This is called the “epiclesis” or invocation. The Church believes that its prayer, made in faith through Christ, is always heard.

The Spirit is Author of the meaning of the sacraments. Sacraments recall the foundational event of Christ’s dying and rising; the faithful assembly is “present” to that event thanks to the Spirit, “inspired memory of the church.” Sacraments signify the bestowal of grace; but this grace is God’s very Gift of self-communication through the action of the Spirit. The sacraments are prophetic signs which look forward to and even give an anticipatory taste of God’s reign. It is the Spirit who structures this coming kingdom.

The Spirit and grace: In all of this, it is not necessary to use the abstract noun “grace.” The Holy Spirit works both in individual persons and in communities in concrete ways. Instead of the abstract term “grace,” let us name the Holy Spirit who makes possible our hearing, who is the living source of our faith, who is the One who informs our prayer and bonds us with Christ, who teaches us to make eucharist with joy – that life-giving Spirit who as both Giver and Gift renews the face of the earth.
The Active Presence of Christ and the Spirit

Mary M. Schaefer

**Two missions:** We have seen that God is present in the world thanks to the two missions of Word and Spirit. Examples from the scriptures of that activity in the life of Jesus, and a kind of "profile" of the Holy Spirit, have been the subject of our reflection.

**In scripture and liturgy:** If scripture witnesses to these two missions, the same should be true for the Christian liturgy. To the extent that the liturgy points to the missions of the Word and the Spirit can it be claimed as representing the integral whole tradition of the church.

**Neglect of the Spirit:** At least since the development of scholasticism in the late twelfth century, the Western (Latin) church has emphasized the mission of the Word as Sanctifier and has overlooked the presence and activity of the Holy Spirit. The churches of the East have looked to the mission of the Spirit in the time of the church, with Christ acknowledged as at work only instrumentally through his ministers. In both cases, only one of the "two hands" of God is taken into account! In theological language, a "binitarian" rather than a trinitarian theology continues to govern the official self-understanding of these faith communities.

**One-sided:** In both traditions there remains the possibility of a one-sided praxis of the faith, and this whenever all members of the faith-community are not awarded full, conscious and active roles in the representation of Christ through the various and myriad ways which faith and love suggest and the Spirit gives — and the church, gifted with the Spirit, acknowledges.

**Patristic Theology of the Presence of Christ**

**Telling stories of Christ:** What is the classical patristic theology of Christ's active presence in the eucharist? The liturgical witness of the ancient churches of East and West provides a way of construing the presence of Christ which relies not on doctrinal statements but rather on concrete narrative imagery. A text from St. John Chrysostom illustrates this genre, which is found both in East and West during the late fourth and fifth centuries and, in the West, continues into the early twelfth century:

This our Table is the same as that (of old) and holds nothing less . . . (Christ) prepares it . . . . When you therefore see how the priest hands you communion, then do not think that it is the priest who does this; but it is the hand of Christ, which extends itself to you.

Another example is provided by a sermon of Theophilus of Alexandria preached on Great and Holy Thursday, A. D. 400: "Together let us hasten to the Mystical Supper. Today Christ feasts us, today Christ serves us. Christ, the Lover-of-Humanity, refreshes us."

**Table host and giver of communion:** The theme of Christ-Wisdom as table host and giver of communion with himself was popular in mosaic, fresco, manuscript and metalwork, both in East and West. It conflates the Last Supper and the Supper of the church, the liturgy of heaven and the earthly liturgy, in an image which still occupies the apse frieze behind the altar of Eastern churches, immediately beneath the great figure of the Theotokos or Mary orans (intercessor).

**Illustrated above** are two distinct scenes. In the first, Christ as priest presides at the Great Entrance of the heavenly liturgy, with angels bringing the gifts for the eucharist. It is from a Romanian Orthodox church near the monastery of Neamt in northern Moldavia. The second is a contemporary "Communion of the Apostles," in which the figure of Christ is shown twice. It is from the refectory of the Russian College in Rome, and shows the distribution of both the bread and the wine.

**Patristic Theology of the Presence of the Holy Spirit**

**The Spirit is invoked:** If all liturgy is ultimately epicletic (that is, invokes God to send the Holy Spirit to make us holy), we should expect to discover the Spirit active and energizing in any and every authentic liturgy. The Catholic tradition counts as sacraments those actions with a specifying word of prayer in which the ecclesial community, gathered about its deputed pastoral leader, invokes God to send the Holy Spirit in favour of persons who face a boundary situation in life or who stand in need of sustenance for the journey of faith (eucharist).

**The Holy Spirit was acknowledged:** During the course of the fourth and fifth centuries, as the great church councils painstakingly established all the components of trinitarian theology, a full-blown epiclesis of the Holy Spirit claimed its rightful place in the classical anaphoras (eucharistic prayers) of the East. Wherever heresy had threatened orthodox belief in the Spirit, the proper work of the Holy Spirit – to make holy – was acknowledged. In the West, which had avoided such heresy, pneumatology was less developed. That the Roman Canon lacks a proper pneumatology may argue for its formation before the First Council of Constantinople.

**The Spirit in Contemporary Liturgies**

**Real presence:** Where contemporary liturgies facilitate the experience of the real presence and activity of both Christ and the Spirit, there a community of faith flourishes. The first step to be taken toward this goal is usually the revision of texts to accommodate a truly trinitarian prayer.

---

The Roman Canon of the Mass could be judged as almost entirely binitarian; the Holy Spirit is referred to explicitly only in the closing doxology. This fact certainly accounts for the noticeable gap in pneumatology in official Roman theology. Where the Spirit fails to be mentioned as the active divine power in the eucharist, there is always danger of substitutionary explanations which attribute power to human instruments. In the case of pneumatology it can be seen that the practice of prayer indeed determines the formulation of theology.

New eucharistic prayers: Basing their structure on ancient patristic models, new Roman eucharistic prayers (as well as those of virtually all other Christian churches which are dialogue-partners) invariably contain an epiclesis, or invocation to God to send the Spirit to 1) transform the bread and wine so that they become the sacrament of Christ's Body and Blood, and 2) transform the people who receive these holy gifts, that they become Christ's corporate body.²

Symbolic Character of the Liturgy

The activity of the Trinity: The liturgy is a realizing symbol of the life of faith in all of its dimensions. Since the Trinity is abroad in the world which it has created and maintains in existence, and most certainly is not only to be found in the church, the liturgy should find ways to acknowledge the activity of the Trinity in all the the variety and freshness which the Spirit inspires and in the different historical structures which give a qualified visibility to the present action of the risen Lord.

Of course liturgy is more than texts. Liturgy is spatial and temporal as well as textual; in its three-dimensionality it has need of a variety of persons and media. To suggest that the liturgical event must exhibit the active presence of the economic Trinity if it is to be fully Christian and not simply monotheistic or binitarian is to require some serious rethinking of our often two- or one-dimensional practices. Since liturgy is symbolic enactment of the whole life of faith, we would do well to begin with our symbolizing of the church.

Trinity as Model for Ministries

Gift and discernment: What part individual persons will play in upbuilding the church through the use of their gifts of grace will be predicated on what these charisms in fact equip them to do. The individual sense of call will not be sole arbiter; the church will help them discern what gift they can offer.

All graced by the Spirit: A dynamic pilgrim people of God will make possible the representation of its faith by the entire range of persons and gifts, since each initiated Christian is graced by the Spirit with charisms to give and to receive. The personal-sacramental mission of the Word in the world will continue to be represented by persons ordained by laying on of hands and prayer to the leadership functions of preaching, pastoring, and animating

liturgical worship. The gift of the Spirit of holiness will be invoked in the ordination rite so that the ministries of the ordained will be animated by faithful love of the people they serve.

Many ministries: But ordained ministers will not be the only persons deputed by the church for leadership functions. Other believers too will be recognized as representing Christ by representing the church, although their representation will be of a different order from those serving in personal-sacramental offices. They will be equipped by their sharing in the common priesthood and by their specific charisms, discerned and supported by the ecclesial members. In many believers the witness of holiness will continue its simple and direct preaching of Christ as it has through the ages.

The Presence of Christ in Contemporary Theology


Cosmic presence: The one Word which is spoken by God from eternity was active in the creation. The Word incarnate is, however, given a new and cosmic presence thanks to the resurrection: "Christ is all and in all" (Colossians 3.11). This cosmic presence is one which is not dependent on the exercise of faith.

Habitual presence: A second kind of presence is that called habitual: Christ indwells the believer by faith. "Christ in me, I in Christ? is the exultant exclamation of the one who knows Christ as constant companion and lover. Habitual union is predicated on faith; it takes place through the mediation of the Holy Spirit.3

Mutual active presence: When believers interact to manifest their faith, we see the exercise of the mutual active presence of Christ. This is why "space" in which to exercise the charisms is so essential to a healthy ecclesial and liturgical life. Manifestation of the faith builds up the community of faith and reaches out to those beyond its borders. It enables the community (corporately and as individuals) to "receive" in faith the Christ who has a special presence in "the least" of humanity’s brothers and sisters (Matthew 25.40).

The modes of the mutual active presence of Christ, in which the risen Lord is the active agent and the believer or assembly of faithful the active respondents, have been worked out in detail since initially formulated for the Constitution on the Liturgy, no. 7. Pope Paul VI himself contributed to later stages of this development. These modes of Christ's presence have very important implications for liturgical practice and for ecumenical recognition.4

3 See Yves Congar, I Believe in the Holy Spirit, vol. 2, especially 100-111
4 On the modes of Christ's presence see the simplified presentation in Schaefer and Henderson, Catholic Priesthood, 54-59; and Kilmartin, Christian Liturgy, 303-355. Churches which lack the Roman Catholic theology of the somatic real or "substantial" presence of Christ in the consecrated bread and wine frequently have a highly developed sense of Christ's active presence. Ideally attention will be paid to all modes of his presence.
Active Presence of Christ in the Liturgy

**The second, third and fourth memorial acclamations** following the narrative of institution in the Roman Mass address Christ directly as chief celebrant of the liturgy: “Dying you destroyed our death . . ., “When we eat this bread . . .,” “Lord, by your cross and resurrection you have set us free . . ..” The second and fourth are properly acclamatory; Christ is acclaimed as risen and present. Christ's risen presence is the chief reason why the liturgy of the church, which tradition has always understood as concelebrated with the angels and saints, has a heavenly aspect.

**Word-oriented:** The way the memorial acclamation relates to the institution narrative in the Roman Mass brings to mind the word-oriented rather than pneumatological explanation of eucharistic conversion proposed by St. Ambrose: “the word of Christ confects this sacrament.”

**Fails to address Christ directly:** The most frequently used “acclamation” is really a confession of belief. “Christ has died, Christ is risen, Christ will come again,” fails to address Christ directly, pointing to the lack of recognition of the full reality of Christ's active presence in Roman Catholic liturgy as currently celebrated in North America. This contrasts with recognition of Christ's “somatic” or bodily real presence in the bread and wine. Reflection on the implications of the meaning and interrelation of nos. 7 and 8 of the Constitution on the Liturgy will lead to a heightened appreciation of the way in which the economic Trinity acts to integrate worshippers into its dynamic life.

Active Presence of the Spirit in the Liturgy

**And what of the active presence of the Spirit?** Acclamations sung out by the assembly with full voice afford evidence that the Holy Spirit is active. The Spirit, sharing source of faith with Christ in the believer, is the bond which unites the faithful “horizontally” with one another and “vertically” with Christ, and – through Christ – with God. St. Augustine illustrates two ways in which the Spirit “speaks” in believers: 1) “Listen to the Holy Spirit saying through me: ‘Sing to the Lord a new song’ . . . Live good lives, and you yourselves will be his praise.” 2) “His praise is in the assembly of the saints’; it is in the singers themselves.”

**The Holy Spirit,** as divine Author or Proto-Symbolizer of the whole shape of the liturgy, is the Animator and Energizer of the personal and corporate doxological response of faith. Do our liturgies give more than verbal acknowledgement to that underlying truth?

---

5 In English; the three in French correspond more accurately to the Roman typical edition.
Focus on the Trinity: Without question the most important feature of the sacraments as celebrated and reflected upon since Vatican Council II is their explicit focus on the economic Trinity — with all that implies for the response and sanctification of human beings considered elsewhere in this Bulletin. These pages are being written as news comes of the death, on June 16, 1994, of Father Edward J. Kilmartin, S. J. Father Kilmartin, professor at Weston College, the University of Notre Dame and then at the Pontifical Oriental Institute in Rome, spent the later years of his life as theologian and teacher in constructing a liturgical theology grounded on the Trinity.

A coherent trinitarian perspective, Father Kilmartin believed, has rich possibilities for leading us forward as communities of faith into deeper appreciation of the corporate prayer of the church, new models of ecclesiology (the theology of the church), rapprochement between churches of the East and West, and openness to ecumenical initiatives. Study of a summary article of Father Kilmartin's entitled “Sacraments as Liturgy of the Church,”1 provides an accessible introduction to the perspectives of this “new” liturgical-sacramental theology.

The Structure of Sacraments

Sacraments are embedded in the church's worship. Their structure is familiar:

- the word of the scriptures which, through anamnesis (remembering), founds the community’s confidence in God’s will to save, with its interpretation in preaching;
- solemn prayer of praise and thanksgiving offered to God in the name of the whole church;
- invocation to God to send the Spirit who makes holy, offered in favour of an individual or of the whole assembly gathered;
- a sacramental action signifying a new or deepened relationship with Christ, and through Christ with God.

Doxology: Such liturgical prayer is doxological, for the community gathered and structured by the Holy Spirit to show its dependence on Christ knows with the certainty of faith that prayer offered in the name of Christ, through its high

1 Theological Studies (September 1989) 527-547.
priest and mediator, and with Christ the chief celebrant of its liturgy, is always heard.

Such prayer is by nature trinitarian, since the "two hands of God at work in the world" collaborate in returning human beings to God. In an earlier discussion, descending and ascending christology helped to make sense of scriptural data which at first glance seemed contradictory. Trinitarian data is by nature complex. Can a model be proposed which will help us understand how the activity of Word and Spirit in the world corresponds to God's inner life? We keep in mind Rahner's axiom that what God does in the world is necessarily congruent with the life of the Trinity in itself.

Bestowal model: What is called in contemporary theology the "bestowal" model or "model of return" aids in integrating ascending christology with the theology of the Trinity. More important for our purposes, the bestowal model helps us to understand liturgical dynamics from God's perspective: how we are integrated into the divine life. This model may be thought of as having three stages.

First stage: According to the bestowal model, in the inner life of the Trinity the Father generates the Son and bestows the Holy Spirit on the beloved Son. The Son, who is equal with the Father and responds to the Father's total self-giving, returns this same Spirit of love to the Father. This description of trinitarian activity shows the inner life of the Trinity: it is inspired by the gospel of John.

With a similar movement, in the time of the church the risen Christ, now ascended and sitting at the Father's right hand, is empowered to bestow the Spirit on those who respond with faith. Christ's sending of the Spirit mirrors God's offer of grace.

Second stage: In the economic Trinity the Father is source of life, the Son is revelation (Word) of God, and the Spirit is the power and love of God. If we begin with the data of ascending christology, God anoints with the Spirit the person of Jesus, who by that anointing in Mary's womb is united in person with the Word. In his turn Jesus, through all the discrete acts of saying "Yes" to God in the course of his human life, bestows the Spirit of love on the one he calls "Abba."

Third stage: Sacraments enable our encounter with Christ in faith. In the sacraments the risen Christ associates believers with himself, in order to mediate, through the Spirit, their encounter with God. In the midst of the church, the

---

2 For an introduction to liturgy as prayer and source of spirituality see Kevin W. Irwin, Liturgy, Prayer and Spirituality (New York: Paulist 1984)

3 A model is a way of simplifying and conceptualizing complicated and seemingly conflicting data. On the "bestowal" model see the table of contents in the works by D. Coffey and E. J. Kilmartin listed in the annotated bibliography.
risen Lord in the Spirit intercedes with God to send the life-giving Spirit to make holy his body, the members of the church.

Sharing in the divine life: Brought before God by Christ their mediator and thus made acceptable, God responds to the needs of those God loves and bestows on them the Spirit of love. Thus Christ's disciples are introduced into the trinitarian communion. They share in the divine life, which the West calls "sanctification" and the East "divinization."

For all sacraments: Taking into account the differences between the various sacraments, this model of trinitarian relationships can be applied to all sacramental celebrations. Each sacrament in its own way configures us to Christ, who, perfectly open to God's purposes through the inspiration of the Holy Spirit, has walked the way of human beings before us and, now risen, represents us to God as well as gives us communion with one another.

Utilizing this model it is possible to explain how Christians, united with the human Jesus through baptism and anointed by the Spirit (made "christs" according to St. Cyril of Jerusalem), become daughters and sons of God and are nurtured in the Christian life.

The seven sacraments each have their proper liturgies because each sacrament answers to a different condition or need of the human person. The change which has taken place in liturgical-sacramental praxis thanks to the revision of liturgical rites since 1970 and their implementation (and in some places, inculturation) still is not fully incorporated into the decisions we make about their celebration and the ways that we talk about sacraments. However, the way we pray gradually leads to adjustment of the ways in which we explain our beliefs. This is happening as sacramental theology is progressively integrated into the theology of liturgy.

How to celebrate better? What follows is a summary overview of each of the sacraments. As you, the reader, participate in various sacramental liturgies, pay attention to the role of the economic Trinity in each. Ask yourself: what could my parish or community do to highlight the divine activity which forms the core of this sacramental celebration, so that participants might better enter into dialogue with their God?

Rite of Christian Initiation of Adults

The Holy Spirit as Gift of God is present from the beginning of the catechumen's journey toward faith. In other words, the Spirit is at work at every stage to bring the inquirer to faith, and then to maintain him or her in this gift. At the same time, faith is given in baptism, traditionally called "sacrament of faith." That is why the Catholic churches consider baptism to be the indispensable first step to participation in every other sacrament.

---

4 Does this mean that persons who are not followers of Christ, and hence do not participate in sacraments, are excluded from the divine communion? No. But they will not be able to describe their relationship with God as having the specific personal relations of the Trinity.
From the beginning of their journey, candidates are incorporated into prayer which is trinitarian and liturgical in its structure. It is presumed that they will enter into this expression of ecclesial faith, and thus come to the acceptance of Jesus as their Lord.

In the liturgy of baptism itself, the saints are first invoked, presuming that with this rite we are participating in some way in the liturgy of heaven. In the long epi­cletic prayer made over the water to be used in baptism, the narrative of the Trinity at work in the word is rehearsed, together with the inclusion of the chosen people in the history of salvation. The profession of faith takes a triadic form, while the baptismal formula, “in the name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Spirit,” follows that of the Matthean community (Matthew 28.19).

Multiple symbols – water, oil, the sign of the cross, light – are nonverbal ways in which the one to be baptized experiences what it means to be buried and clothed in Christ and anointed with the Holy Spirit. The willing adult acceptance of faith corresponds to the sacramental gift of faith – with all that involves.

The paradigm of adult baptism is Jesus’ own baptism in the Jordan. Irenaeus describes Jesus’ baptism in terms of a rite:

The Father is the one who anoints,
the Son is the anointed one,
and the Spirit is the chrism.

Reception of the eucharist, which establishes sacramental communion with Christ, symbolizes and effects incorporation into the church, body of Christ, at the same time that it makes the newly baptized a participant in the intimate trinitarian community.

Mystagogical instruction: Such a rich liturgical experience requires follow-up with mystical instruction. There, a narrative but theologically inspired meditation on the meaning of the sacraments received is appropriate.

Rite of Baptism for Children

The normative order for children, even when confirmation and eucharist are separated from baptism, is baptism, confirmation, eucharist. This affirms their intrinsic relationship with the adult rite, and the relationship of washing/incorporation into Christ with integration into the church/bestowal of the Spirit.

How can a child receive the “sacrament of faith”? The community of faith supplies for the inability to respond by providing the faith-context in which the child can be nurtured into faith. In this instance it is clear why the trinitarian content of the rite needs to be strong: the community must be reminded of the saving activity of God and accept its full part in the Christian upbringing of the child.

Trinitarian faith: In both the RCIA and the rite for children, faith is to the fore – a trinitarian faith whose expression and components go back to third and fourth century models developed in the churches of East and West which at that time formed the communion of churches.

Summary: The following attempts to summarize this trinitarian explanation for these sacraments of initiation.

- The rites include the symbolic actions of profession of faith, bath with prayer, laying on of hands with prayer, and anointing with chrism.

---

5 Developed on the basis of Kilmartin, *Christian Liturgy*, 49.
The profession of faith symbolizes the person’s engagement of faith. The bath with prayer symbolizes purification and dying and rising. The other symbolic actions symbolize inclusion in a eucharistic communion and consecration into active Christian service.

All of this denotes (that is, means at the human social level) incorporation into a community of followers of Jesus.

All of this connotes (that is, means at the level of ultimate spiritual reality) incorporation into the body of Christ by the gift of the Spirit as children of God.

Confirmation

The Rite of Confirmation has as paradigm the day of Pentecost and the Spirit-events which formed the early church. After the Liturgy of the Word, the cardinal articles of the Creed are affirmed in the renewal of baptismal promises. Laying on of hands with epicletic prayer and anointing of the candidates with chrism by the bishop form the core of the sacramental rite. The Holy Spirit is here called “Gift.” The bishop greets the newly confirmed with the phrase which recalls the risen Christ in the upper room on Easter evening: “Peace be with you” (John 20.19). The general intercessions lead directly to the Eucharist.

Questions of a theological nature might be raised about the formula associated with the chrismation. However, naming the Holy Spirit rather than using the impersonal term grace, and calling the Spirit Gift, represent the trinitarian personalizing which is the heritage of classical patristic theology.

Eucharist

Eucharist not only completes initiation but nourishes and sustains the initiated in their life-long journey of faith.

The Mass of Paul VI (1970): A comparison of the Tridentine Mass of Pius V (1570) and the eucharistic liturgy of 1970 will show basic similarities, but there are noteworthy differences as well. From the perspective of trinitarian content, the canon of the Tridentine Mass is christomonistic — that is, the work of Christ is acknowledged, but that of the Spirit is barely alluded to. Since Eucharistic Prayer I in the 1970 Sacramentary remains close to its ancient Roman model, it makes scant reference to the Holy Spirit and does not integrate salvation history and ascending christology into its pattern of prayer beyond what is found in 1570.6

Eucharistic prayers II, III and IV each reflect a particular model and theological perspective. However, all are distinctively shaped by the so-called “split epiclesis” of the ancient Alexandrian church. The Spirit is invoked on the elements before the recital of the institution narrative, and again on the people after the anamnesis-offering. This duplication has the virtue of emphasizing

the doctrine of real presence of the Body and Blood of Christ in the bread and wine, and the belief that sacramental participation really leads to sanctification.

**Difficulties:** Its disadvantage is that the literary structure does not support the theological content, in which the Christ-event is presented as high point of salvation history and the self-offering of Jesus becomes the pattern for our lives. The narrative rhythm of the eucharistic prayer (always the prayer of the whole community) remains somewhat disjointed; it can be difficult for members of the assembly to remain fully attentive to its content and therefore pray it as their own.

**Eucharistic Prayers of Eastern Churches**

**Comparison of anaphoras** (eucharistic prayers) of the ancient churches of the East reveals a striking sense of the interrelation of earthly and heavenly liturgies, a wealth of imagery, and recognition of the trinitarian intimacy to which participation in the Lord’s Table invites us. Constantly recurring references to the Trinity-in-itself (“The Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit, the Trinity one in being and undivided”) place us in the presence of the three-personed God and make us participants in the liturgy of heaven. The structure is reminiscent of the divine *perichoresis*, the in-and-out play of the persons in their celebration of knowledge and love of one another. Liturgy associates believers with that *perichoresis*; hence the familiarity which devout Christians of the East display at worship.⁷

For Latin-rite Christians, the intimacy with which the liturgies of the East move back and forth between divine and human direct address may at first be disconcerting. Integration into the life of the immanent rather than the economic Trinity is at the fore for Eastern Christians. Their liturgies anticipate the end-times, whereas churches of the West have until recently focused on the church’s charter-event in history: the cross. Of course, both cross and heavenly liturgy must receive their due attention if liturgy is to be true to the integral whole tradition of the church.

**Close to us:** North Americans do not have to journey to Eastern Europe to experience a living tradition of Eastern theology, for the East is close at hand in the variety of ancient Orthodox and Oriental churches of the diaspora.⁸

**The Eucharists of Eastern Catholic Churches in Canada**

**For better understanding:** Familiarity with, for example, the Ukrainian Catholic or Maronite Catholic churches in Canada, both of which are in union with the Roman Catholic church, suggests itself as an imperative for Canadian Catholics who wish to gain a deeper understanding of the shape and meaning of the sacraments. The Ukrainian Catholic Church utilizes most commonly the

---


⁸ Any of the books by the Orthodox theologian Alexander Schmemann will give an entrée to the centrality of the doctrine of the Trinity for the life of worship and sacraments; see annotated bibliography. See also the classic work on initiation by the 14th century theologian Nicholas Cabasilas, *The Life in Christ* (Crestwood: St. Vladimir’s Seminary Press 1974).
"Divine Liturgy of St. John Chrysostom," which, with the festal "Liturgy of St. Basil," is the characteristic text for Byzantine churches, both Catholic and Orthodox. The context of the service, the architectural setting and display of icons, and the various devotional customs, represent inculturation of the gospel in the early centuries of Christianity as it spread out from Jerusalem.  

Sacraments of Healing: Reconciliation, Anointing

The Rite of Penance (1975) is clearly conscious of God and of Christ, and, depending upon the options chosen, may also include mention of the Holy Spirit. Pneumatology is not to the fore except in the formula for general absolution, which is fully trinitarian.

The rite of Anointing of the Sick makes use of the oil of the sick blessed by the bishop at the Chrism Mass on Holy Thursday. We would expect to find acknowledgement of the Holy Spirit's role, and we do. In fact, the prayers and their structure witness with sureness to the trinitarian economy.

Sacraments of State of Life: Marriage, Orders

The present Rite of Marriage (1969; Canadian edition 1979) is the weakest of the sacramental rites when critiqued in trinitarian terms. It is also the weakest liturgically. This is unfortunate when one considers the power of strong liturgy and of eloquent symbols to preach Christ and witness to gospel values. However, lack of explicit trinitarian content in the ritual has not prevented theological reflection on the content of committed marriage itself.  

The rites for ordination of deacon, priest and bishop are given in the Roman Pontifical (ICEL 1978). There is a clear acknowledgement of the work of the Trinity in the economy at the level of the rite. Analysis of the consequences of trinitarian life for the theology of ordained ministry, servant-structure of the church, requires further work on the part of the whole church.


See, for example, David Hassel, Dark Intimacy (Chicago: Loyola University Press 1986) 111-131.  

The central texts for presbyteral ordination are grouped in the Appendix to M. M. Schaefer and J. F. Henderson, The Catholic Priesthood: A Liturgically Based Theology of the Presbyteral Office (Ottawa: CCCB 1990) 94-98. The text investigates the trinitarian questions raised elsewhere in this issue with special attention to ordained ministry.
Pentecost

The liturgical celebration of Pentecost includes Pentecost Day and the Vigil of Pentecost. The new edition of the Lectionary provides new readings for both days. Though the first reading for Pentecost Day – the story of Pentecost from Acts 2 – is used in Years A, B and C, the second reading and gospel now are different each year.

In addition to the readings for the Vigil of Pentecost found in the previous edition of the Lectionary – which include a choice of four readings from the Hebrew scriptures – there is now an optional “Extended Vigil of Pentecost” with a total of nine readings, arranged as for the Easter Vigil.

In addition to the eucharistic celebrations, the Liturgy of the Hours offers evening prayer 1, morning prayer, and evening prayer 2. Finally, the Office of Readings provides rich fare as well.

The word “pentecost” means the fiftieth day, and comes from our Jewish heritage: the Feast of Shavu’ot or Firstfruits, celebrated seven weeks or fifty days after Passover.

The story of Pentecost is proclaimed in several time frames. There is the day of Pentecost itself, there is the entire period from Easter to Pentecost, there is the long era from the creation of the world until Jesus Christ, there is the period of the church and its holy people following Pentecost. Finally, there is the continuing action of the Holy Spirit in the world throughout its existence, past, present and future. In our liturgies, these several time frames are woven to and fro in a rich design.

In the scripture readings, prayers, antiphons, responsories, intercessions and other liturgical texts of Pentecost Vigil and Pentecost Day, we proclaim the story of the Spirit of transforming life. We also name ourselves as participants in this new life and the life of the Spirit. Here we organize the story of the Holy Spirit under a number of headings.

The Spirit and the Paschal Mystery

The coming of the Holy Spirit is itself part of the paschal mystery, and the Spirit was present and active in the passion, death and resurrection of Jesus Christ. The preface for Pentecost says, “today you sent the Holy Spirit . . . and so you brought the paschal mystery to its completion.” Other texts say, “you fulfilled the Easter promise by sending us your Holy Spirit,” and “fifty days have celebrated the fullness of the mystery of your revealed love.”

The water and blood that flowed from the side of Jesus on the cross are seen as a symbol of the sending of the Spirit by the Risen Christ.

1 Opening prayer, vigil
2 Alternative opening prayer, vigil
Lord Jesus, when you were raised high upon the cross, streams of living water flowed from your pierced side; pour out on us your life-giving Spirit.  

Water flowed from the side of Christ as the fountain of your Spirit; may it flow over all the earth and bring forth goodness.

**The water and blood of the crucifixion** are also related to Jesus’ words, related in the gospel of the Vigil liturgy: “Let anyone who is thirsty come to me, and let the one who believes in me drink. . . . Out of the believer’s heart shall flow rivers of living water. Now he said this about the Spirit, which believers in him were to receive.” Also:

On the last day of the festival, Jesus stood and cried aloud: If anyone is thirsty, let him come to me and drink, alleluia.

**The Spirit was also instrumental in the resurrection** of Jesus Christ from the dead. The second reading for Year C refers to “the Spirit of God who raised Jesus from the dead.”

Through the Spirit you raised your Son from the dead; raise up the bodies of the dead into everlasting life.

On this day the Holy Spirit appeared before the apostles in tongues of fire and gave them . . . spiritual gifts. [The Spirit] sent them out to preach to the whole world, and to proclaim that all who believe and are baptized shall be saved, alleluia.

**The Spirit and the Birth of the Church**

**A central focus** of the liturgies of Pentecost is of course the day of the original experience of the Holy Spirit by the disciples gathered at Jerusalem fifty days after the Resurrection of Jesus Christ. This is proclaimed in the first reading for Pentecost Day. There is the sudden rush of wind from heaven and the tongues of fire; all are filled with the Holy Spirit and begin to speak in other languages. The people of Jerusalem and pilgrims from afar hear the apostles speak of God’s deeds of power.

This part of the Pentecost story is retold in various liturgical texts:

On the day of Pentecost they had all gathered together in one place, alleluia.

Suddenly from the heavens there came the sound of a great wind, alleluia.

---

2 Intercessions, morning prayer  
4 Intercessions, morning prayer  
5 Communion antiphon, vigil  
6 Intercessions, evening prayer 2  
7 Canticle of Mary antiphon, evening prayer 2  
8 Psalm antiphon, evening prayer 1  
9 Psalm antiphon, office of readings
Tongues as of fire appear before the apostles, and the Holy Spirit came upon each of them, alleluia.  

The apostles preached in different tongues, and proclaimed the great works of God, alleluia.  

All were filled with the Holy Spirit, and they began to speak, alleluia.  

When the days of Pentecost were complete, God sent the Holy Spirit upon the apostles.  

They were all filled with the Holy Spirit, and they spoke of the great things God has done.  

On the day of Pentecost they had all gathered together in one place. Out of the heavens suddenly there came the sound of a great wind, which filled the whole house, alleluia.  

The disciples had gathered together in one room. Suddenly there came a sound from heaven.  

Today we celebrate the great beginnings of your church when the Holy Spirit made known to all peoples the one true God, and created from the many [human] languages one voice to profess one faith.  

Though they spoke many different languages, you united the nations in professing the same faith, alleluia.  

The story of the original Pentecost is also applied to our lives and the church today. 

Father of light, from whom every good gift comes, send your Spirit into our lives with the power of a mighty wind and by the flame of your wisdom open the horizons of our minds. Loosen our tongues to sing your praise in words beyond the power of speech, for without your Spirit [we] could never raise [our voices] in words of peace, or announce the truth that Jesus is Lord.  

---

10 Psalm antiphon, evening prayer 1  
11 Psalm antiphon, morning prayer  
12 Psalm antiphon and responsory, morning prayer  
13 Introduction to intercessions, evening prayer 1  
14 Communion antiphon  
15 Responsory, office of readings  
16 Responsory, office of readings  
17 Preface  
18 Canticle of Mary antiphon, evening prayer 1  
19 Alternative opening prayer
Lord, through this eucharist, send the Holy Spirit of Pentecost into our lives to keep us always in your love.\textsuperscript{20}

Come, Holy Spirit, fill the hearts of your faithful and kindle in them the fire of your love.\textsuperscript{21}

Come, Holy Spirit, fill the hearts of all believers and set them on fire with your love.\textsuperscript{22}

Send your Spirit into your Church to be its life and vigor, that it may bring new life to the whole world.\textsuperscript{23}

The next several perspectives on the life-giving presence and action of the Holy Spirit are presented in the readings from the Hebrew scriptures that are presented for the Extended Vigil liturgy.

The Spirit and Human Life

The first reading tells the account of the creation of humanity – woman and man – according to Genesis 2. The breathing of life into the first human is an act of the Spirit.

You breathed the breath of life into Adam.\textsuperscript{24}

God our Father, you have given us new birth.\textsuperscript{25}

You bring life and glory to [humanity] through the Holy Spirit; through the Spirit lead the departed into the love and joy of heaven.\textsuperscript{26}

The Spirit and Human Communication

The second reading is the story of the tower of Babel. It is a curious story, which simultaneously provides a model of unity of language among humans that is renewed on Pentecost Day, and a story of pride and presumption that leads to human disunity and multiplicity of languages.

The Spirit and the Covenant and Law

The third reading tells of the encounter of God and Moses on Mount Sinai. God is present in fire, accompanied by thunder, lightning, cloud and trumpet blast, and this vision inspires the account of the Spirit's presence on Pentecost. New life is given by the Spirit through the covenant and the law. The people responded, "Everything that the Lord has spoken we will do."

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textsuperscript{20} Prayer after communion
  \item \textsuperscript{21} Gospel acclamation
  \item \textsuperscript{22} Canticle of Mary antiphon, evening prayer 1
  \item \textsuperscript{23} Intercessions, evening prayer 1
  \item \textsuperscript{24} Intercessions, morning prayer
  \item \textsuperscript{25} Opening prayer, vigil
  \item \textsuperscript{26} Intercessions, evening prayer 1
\end{itemize}
The Spirit of Creative Wisdom

The fourth reading, from Proverbs 8, interprets God's Holy Spirit in terms of God's Holy Wisdom. It proclaims in poetic manner the existence of the Spirit from before the beginning of the world. We are meant to remember Genesis 1.2, "A wind [or breath or spirit] of God swept over the face of the waters." From the moment of creation, the Spirit has been in the world as a renewing force.

The Spirit of the Lord has filled the whole world, alleluia. [The Spirit] sustains all creation and knows every word that is spoken. 27

In the beginning you created heaven and earth. 28

Let streams and rivers and all creatures that live in the waters sing praise to God, alleluia. 29

The Spirit and the Covenant in Our Hearts

The fifth reading speaks of the covenant and law of God which the Spirit writes in the hearts of God's people. All – from the least of them to the greatest – will know God from the experience of the Spirit who is within them.

The Spirit and Life after Death

The sixth reading is the story of dry bones from the prophet Ezekiel. The prophet is told: "Prophesy to the breath [or spirit], prophesy, mortal, and say to the breath: breathe upon these slain, that they may live . . . and the breath came into them, and they lived." God then says, "I will put my spirit within you, and you shall live."

The Spirit of Prophesy

The seventh reading is the passage from the prophet Joel that is quoted in part at the beginning of the Acts of the Apostles, "I will pour out my spirit on all flesh; your sons and your daughters shall prophesy."

The Spirit of Continuing Creation and Renewal

Portions of Psalm 104 are used as the responsorial psalm for the Vigil and for Pentecost Day, especially because of verse 30: "When you send forth your spirit, they are created; and you renew the face of the earth." This is reformulated into a prayer imperative: "Lord, send out your Spirit, and renew the face of the earth." The creating and re-creating presence and action of the Holy Spirit continues throughout the past, the present and into the future, and touches all humanity and the entire creation.

27 Psalm antiphon, evening prayer 2; entrance antiphon
28 Intercessions, morning prayer
29 Psalm antiphon, morning prayer
As we celebrate this great feast with joy and faith, let us cry out: Send forth your Spirit and make the whole world new.30

In the beginning you created heaven and earth, and in the fullness of time you renewed all things in Christ; through your Spirit go on renewing the world with the gift of salvation.31

Send forth your Spirit and they shall be created; and you will renew the face of the earth, alleluia.32

Through the Spirit you make all things new; heal the sick, comfort the distressed, give salvation to all.33

The Spirit Empowers the Church to Forgive Sin

In the gospel for Year A, Jesus says, "Receive the Holy Spirit. If you forgive the sins of any, they are forgiven them." Life and transformation come through the lifting of the burden of sin.

Receive the Holy Spirit; the sins of those you forgive shall be forgiven, alleluia.34

You gave your Spirit to the apostles with the power to forgive sin; destroy all sin in the world.35

The Spirit Gives Us Strength to Witness

In Year B's gospel, Jesus promises to send the Advocate (or Paraclete), who is the Spirit of truth, who will guide us into all the truth. The Spirit will also empower us to testify – give witness – on behalf of Jesus. Life and transformation come through truth and witnessing to the truth: the person of Jesus Christ. The reading for morning prayer proclaims, "We are witnesses to all this [that is, the resurrection of Jesus Christ], we and the Holy Spirit."

Strengthen us with your Holy Spirit and fill us with your light.36

Let the Spirit you sent on your Church to begin the teaching of the gospel continue to work in the world through the hearts of all who believe. 37

Send your Spirit on these gifts and through them help the Church you love to show your salvation to all the world.38

---

30 Introduction to intercessions, evening prayer 1
31 Intercessions, evening prayer 1
32 Psalm antiphon, office of readings
33 Intercessions, evening prayer 2
34 Canticle of Zechariah antiphon, morning prayer
35 Intercessions, morning prayer
36 Opening prayer, vigil
37 Opening prayer
38 Prayer over the gifts, vigil

182
Send us your strength, O God, from your holy temple in Jerusalem, and perfect your work in us, alleluia.\textsuperscript{39}

You promised to send the Spirit of truth, to bear witness to yourself, send forth your Spirit to make us your faithful witnesses.\textsuperscript{40}

The Spirit Keeps Us Faithful to Jesus Christ

In the gospel for Year C, Jesus again promises to send the Advocate, who will be God's presence with us and the church forever. This Advocate is also a teacher, and will “remind” us of Jesus – that is, keep us faithful to him.

The Holy Spirit is the Paraclete, alleluia, alleluia. [The Spirit] will teach you all things.\textsuperscript{41}

Lord, may the Spirit you promised lead us into all truth, and reveal to us the full meaning of this sacrifice.\textsuperscript{42}

The Spirit is Bond of Unity in the Church

The second reading for Year A speaks first of the many gifts of the Spirit expressed in the church. It then proclaims the unity of the church in the Spirit: “For in the one Spirit we were all baptized into one body . . . and we were all made to drink of one Spirit.” The same message is proclaimed in the reading for evening prayer 2, “Do all you can to preserve the unity of the Spirit . . . . There is one Body, one Spirit.”

Christ the Lord has gathered his Church in unity through the Spirit.\textsuperscript{43}

God the Father has gathered his Church in unity through Christ. With joy in our hearts let us ask him: Send your Holy Spirit into the Church.\textsuperscript{44}

You desire the unity of all Christians through one baptism in the Spirit; make all who believe one in heart and soul.\textsuperscript{45}

Lord God, Father of all [humanity], you desire to gather together your scattered children in unity of faith; enlighten the world by the grace of the Holy Spirit.\textsuperscript{46}

May [the] Spirit unite the races and nations on earth to proclaim your glory.\textsuperscript{47}
May [the Spirit's flame] come to rest in our heart and disperse the divisions of word and tongue. With one voice and one song may we praise your name in joy and thanksgiving.48

Keep within us the vigor of your Spirit and protect the gifts you have given to your Church.49

The Spirit Brings Love, Joy and Other Fruits

In Year B the second reading describes qualities of human life for those who do and do not live in the Spirit. Those who live by the Spirit enjoy the fruits of the Spirit: “love, joy, peace, patience, kindness, generosity, faithfulness, gentleness, and self-control.”

The love of God has been poured into our hearts by [God’s] spirit living in us, alleluia.50

The Lord has not given us a timid spirit, but a spirit of strength, of love, and of self-control.51

The Spirit of Life Dwells in Us

The second reading for Year C affirms that “you are in the Spirit, since the Spirit of God dwells in you.” Furthermore, God “will give life to your mortal bodies also through [God’s] Spirit that dwells in you.” Evening prayer 1 uses a shortened version of the same passage.

The Spirit Intercedes for Us

The second reading for Pentecost Vigil describes us as those “who have the first fruits of the Spirit.” We are consoled and given hope by the belief that “the Spirit helps us in our weakness” and that the “Spirit intercedes with sighs too deep for words . . . the Spirit intercedes for the saints.”

Other

Help all [peoples] to build a world of justice and peace.52

The Spirit breathes where [it] wills; you hear [its] voice but do not know where [it] comes from or where [it] is going, alleluia.53

O Lord, how good and gentle is your Spirit in us, alleluia.54

48 Alternative opening prayer, vigil
49 Prayer after communion
50 Entrance antiphon
51 Responsory, office of readings
52 Intercessions, evening prayer 2
53 Psalm antiphon, office of readings
54 Psalm antiphon, morning prayer
Contemporary Challenges to Musicians and Liturgists

Bernadette Gasslein

Bernadette Gasslein is liturgical editor for Novalis, and edits Celebrate! She has a graduate degree from the Institut Catholique de Paris, and has extensive experience in pastoral catechesis and liturgy. She is a cantor in her own parish.

This article is based on an address given in Ottawa to an ecumenical audience at a gathering of the Royal Canadian College of Organists.

There are three challenges that face both church musicians and liturgists:

• developing a common vision that enables these two ministries to work together;
• identifying and enabling the primary music maker of our celebrations;
• recognizing form in celebration and responding to its impact on our liturgies.

Working Together Out of a Common Vision

The issue of collaboration of musicians and liturgists sometimes seems to be contentious. I will look first at liturgy itself, and then at how musicians and liturgists relate to it.

Liturgy is the public worship of God. It is the basic work of the people of God gathered for praise and thanksgiving. It is accomplished through an ordered service that uses, in different ways depending on church traditions, ritual gesture, word and music.

Liturgy expresses the faith of a community. No doubt we all would recognize that a creed enables a group of people to express their faith in common words: “I believe . . .”. In our different ways, our worship services provide another mode of expression for our faith. We perform our worship, that is, we make it visible and tangible and communal in gestures, words and actions that are more or less variable, more or less repeated.

This vision has often been summed up in the Latin phrase of Prosper of Aquitaine, *Lex orandi statuat lex credendi*. What we do at worship (*lex orandi*) establishes what we believe (*lex credendi*). Note that I said: what we do. This vision includes not just the words but also the action of the ritual; music is an integral element of this doing.

Within the Roman Catholic tradition we say that it is the body of Christ, God’s people joined to the risen Jesus, that prays at liturgy. We are not, then, just talking about a local community, isolated from other Christian communities.

185
We are talking about a community that shares life most intimately with the risen, glorious Jesus. Liturgy is our public celebration of that shared life.

Both liturgists and musicians serve the community gathered to celebrate this mystery, each in their different ways. The musician’s craft serves the liturgy (note I said the liturgy, not the liturgist!). So does that of the liturgist.

Liturgists study the documents, the community’s written wisdom about its worship tradition; they know the history of the rites; they have studied their words and gestures, and how these interact. They understand the shape, the patterns, the structures of a community’s rituals. They know how they work. The best liturgists combine this theoretical knowledge with great pastoral sensitivity: they know how to help different communities celebrate well. They know how to make the rites of our faith work. In this, a liturgist’s skills resemble closely those of a musician. Liturgists must take the red marks (the rubrics or “stage directions” marked in red in liturgical books) and the black marks (the many pages of books, commentaries and theologies), and make them come alive as the celebration of a believing community. Just as music comes alive, not on the printed page, but in the performance, so liturgy comes alive not in books but in its performance by the community of faith.

Within the celebration of liturgy, music has a special place. The musician’s art is indispensable, for music enables God’s people to do this work of celebration fully, actively, and consciously. Music engages the whole person: heart, senses, intelligence, body, emotions. It is integral to liturgical action.

The community that gathers to celebrate liturgy needs musicians to help it do its work. I recognize the tension that has existed between musicians and pastors and/or liturgists. It has always surprised me. Without understanding what type of music a rite needs to be well-celebrated – an understanding that liturgists can provide – musicians cannot serve the liturgy well. Without musicians who can then select from the best that our tradition and our contemporary repertoire can offer to serve today’s celebrations, our liturgy loses much of its power and depth.

This means we must end turf warfare. Liturgy belongs neither to liturgists, nor to musicians. Liturgy is the church’s. If musicians or liturgists choose only their vision of liturgy, they quickly become heretics, that is believers who select only a part — the part they like! — and make it the whole. More orthodox (root: “right praise”) is the recognition that none of us owns the liturgy, but each of us has a right to participate in it by virtue of our baptism. We belong to communities whose responsibility is to worship well. When musicians and liturgists come together for the sake of liturgy, we are standing on common ground: holy ground.

Once we can share the recognition that liturgy is a communal action that both musicians and liturgists serve in their own ways, we can work together much more fruitfully. This collaboration will enable us to face together two critical challenges.

Identifying the Primary Music Maker of Our Celebrations and Enabling It to Make Music.

In the last few years an ancient word has been re-introduced into our Roman Catholic liturgical vocabulary: the assembly. It refers to the whole body of the
people of God, gathered by God for liturgy, to do what makes us most the people of God: offer God praise and thanksgiving. The word makes very clear that the presider is not the celebrant: the ordained person does not do the celebrating. We do — the whole people — with Christ and as Christ.

Our common challenge is to help this body of people realize that it is the subject of the liturgical action. The subject is the doer, not the object or the audience. Culturally this approach is certainly challenging, since people are conditioned to be an audience, especially for music. That is why I prefer to say "identifying the primary music maker." ("Musician" definitely sounds like a specialist!) If you asked people in our congregations who the primary music maker is, I dare say most would name the organist, the choir or the cantor. They don't yet see themselves as the primary music maker. This is, within my tradition, an urgent challenge that musicians and liturgists must face together.

It has been said, "The song of the assembly is an event of the presence of Christ." That does not mean the song of the choir. It means the people are singing. It means they know their own voice. Here we are talking about the subject of the liturgical action: the people of God, the body of Christ, acting together.

People tell me that there are three reasons they don't sing.

• Someone told them long ago they couldn't;
• the music is too difficult;
• the music program itself makes them believe that their voice isn't wanted.

To the first I reply with this comment: "If God gave you a good voice, use it for praise; if you think God gave you a bad voice, use it to get even." The point in both instances is: use it!

In being concerned about the people's participation, we must be concerned about whether or not they are actually singing. (Not whether we think they are singing or presume they are singing.) Are they emitting sound? Enabling the assembly to be the primary music maker has several implications. Probably it means reversing the priorities that we have had in the past. Our first concern must be with the people's participation. The choir is secondary, and its role is two-fold: to support the song of the assembly, and to enhance the song of the assembly.

The following principles can help us move towards this common goal of musicians and liturgists: "Good musical leadership fosters and nourishes faith; poor musical leadership weakens and destroys it." The American musician and liturgist, Edward McKenna has written: "Music in the liturgy is so much a part of the fabric of worship that if it is bad or inappropriate, it tears at the very soul of the rite, interrupts prayer, and diverts attention from the mysteries being celebrated."

2 Ibid., no. 64. This formulation plays on an earlier theme found in Music in Catholic Worship (Washington: National Conference of Catholic Bishops 1972, revised 1983).
Our model of music competency must include the ability to elicit a response from the people. This means we must be able honestly to answer these questions: do I care about the people's song? Can the people sing this music? The conclusion reached by The Milwaukee Report is correct: If the musical demands exceed the assembly's ability, or if the quality of the music exceeds their capacity, they can only sit and listen. Then they will say things such as "I can't sing" or "They don't want us to sing." Actions speak louder than words.

To invite the assembly into full, conscious and active participation will demand a musical style possessing a clear melody and form, without rhythmic difficulties. Our liturgy demands many different types of song: hymns, litanies, canticles, psalms, acclamations, processions. All this is music for the assembly and of the assembly.

Promoting the song of the people also means that we must recognize that every culture has the capacity to reveal the God of Jesus Christ. So do their various cultural expressions, including music and dance. We cannot judge music appropriateness for liturgy based only on Western, Northern European standards. This question will become more pressing as the demographics of our communities change, and Christians from various parts of the world bring their traditions and culture to worship.

Refusing to consider or admit other cultural musical expressions into our liturgy is simply a statement that those for whom they are significant are not a significant part of our community. Opting to admit these only to certain celebrations and to characterize these worship services by the style of music used risks further dividing our already fragmented Christian communities. We must learn to value the quality of the music and its ability to serve the liturgy, not just its style.

Recognizing and Responding to the Impact of Form on Celebration

Just as a piece of music has a discernable structure and form - sonata, fugue, opening, development - that is fundamental to its artistic performance, so does a liturgical celebration. Liturgy derives its forms and structures from a series of interwoven factors: the structure of the liturgical seasons, such as Advent, Christmas, Lent, Easter, and Ordinary Time; the structure of the Sunday itself; the structures of the four parts of the liturgy (the Introductory Rites, the Liturgy of the Word, the Liturgy of the Eucharist, and the Concluding Rites); and the structures of the parts within the parts.

Understanding this ritual structure and form is one of the great contributions of liturgical studies of the last ten years. Knowing how this form works will help communities celebrate better and musicians choose the most appropriate music for a given liturgical unity. How does this work?

Ask how the music fits into the whole liturgy. For instance, the eucharistic prayer, from the preface to the Great Amen, is a unified whole. It is also the cli-
max of our celebration. Therefore the acclamations used must exhibit a melodic or harmonic unity, and be able to bear the weight of being part of the most important part of our celebration.

This is tricky, for we have longer and more elaborate repertoire for the introductory rites, which include both the Kyrie and Gloria. Putting too much emphasis on these introductory rites, however, unbalances the whole and says that the Liturgy of the Eucharist is not too important.

Liturgical principles say that the gospel acclamation, the “Alleluia” before the gospel, is a clarion call, rousing us to stand and acknowledge the presence of the risen Jesus who is about to speak in our midst in the words of the gospel. Does the alleluia we sing really do all that? Or is it a perfunctory alleluia, in the right place at the right time, but missing the sense of trumpeting an event of salvation?

As composers work on new repertoires for our celebrations, and musicians scour the existing repertoire, such considerations will be primary. This will mean that, rather than planning music chronologically — starting at the beginning of the service — the planning process must begin with the central actions of our celebrations and work outwards from them.

Liturgy is ritual in nature. That means that repetition is an essential element of liturgy. Can this piece of music bear the weight of being sung week after week, or does one use exhaust its resources? In making this judgement, you must consider both the music and the text. It is important here not to fall into the trap, “newer is better.” Repetition allows a community to enter deeper into the rites.

Repetition does not preclude music imagination. You may want to characterize different seasons of the church year by using different instruments, or no instrument at all.

Another interesting variation on repetition would be this. Mark the unity of a liturgical season such as Lent, Easter or Christmas by the repetition of a particular piece of music week after week. This works particularly well with responsorial music (music with a refrain and verses that are usually sung by a cantor or choir), although you can use it with strophic hymns, too, if you find the right one.

For instance, the seven weeks of the Easter season (Easter through to and including Pentecost) are considered, in the Catholic liturgy, as one feast, “The Great Sunday.” That means that musicians working in the Roman Catholic tradition, knowing this principle, cannot pour all their musical resources into the Easter Triduum — including Easter Sunday — and then collapse exhausted for the next six weeks. No, the season must be considered as a unity, and the resources used appropriately. Music is one of the best ways to mark the unity of this feast. There is a tradition that says, “We are an Easter people, and our song is alleluia.”

What if, during those seven weeks, you were to focus on enabling the people to discover “alleluia” as their song? What if you were to select one piece with a particularly robust and joyful alleluia that people could sing, and used the refrain — perhaps not the whole piece — not once, but in several places in the

---

8 Ibid., nos. 21, 43
celebration? What if, in selecting hymns, you were to choose an Easter hymn that featured an alleluia as the descant? or create the descant yourself? The possibilities are rich and varied.

Think about how this music will be performed in liturgy. The work will be used in a context. For example some people complain that the music of Taizé is boring. Well, it may well be for musicians. But for people who are praying it, who are singing it while walking to communion or gathering round the font, it works very well. It’s simple, you don’t need books, you can add your own harmonies if you want and, in an increasingly multi-lingual society, you can sing the verses in the language of your choice.

Do the music, text, and liturgy say and do the same thing? For example, the refrain of Taizé’s lovely, “Eat this bread” invites: “Eat this bread, drink this cup, come to me and never be hungry . . .”. Roman Catholic communities that sing this as a communion processional must ponder what it means to sing about people eating and drinking, when, in fact, they may not yet offer the cup to all the people all the time. The ritual music is contradicted by the way the ritual is practiced. Our song challenges us to be consistent in our practice – or else to find a more appropriate song.

Similarly, in this situation, a choir singing the communion hymn alone fails to draw the assembly into common song. This latter is important because it enables the people to break out of the sense that communion is a moment of private spiritual expression, and instead to discover this rite as “koinonia,” as coming-into-union-with God and each other.

I hope I have assured you that liturgists consider music an integral and essential part of the liturgical action. It is not something apart from the liturgical action; it is not liturgical “muzak,” there to provide background music while the real action happens elsewhere. But it is not just any kind of music: it is music that is so bonded to the liturgical action that it enhances that action by its presence: the music makes the meaning of the action clearer, and allows the assembly to do the action more richly. The form of both music and liturgy reinforce each other. It is in this interaction that “music shapes the relationship of believers to God and to each other.”

These, then, are the challenges I see facing us: to work together out of a common vision, to make the song of the assembly our primary concern, and to learn to recognize the impact of the form and structure of both music and rite on each other. United in service and working out of a common faith vision, these challenges can be met to the satisfaction of both liturgists and musicians, and of the assemblies we serve. Imagine the assembly as a great instrument whose voice you are tuning to sing God’s praises. Help us become a community where rhythm and pitch and harmony are a sign of God’s Spirit, who gathers us together. Help us experience doing something as a single voice: singing, praising, responding, listening: the unity of the kingdom embodied.

In the music you help us make, may we hear the sound of God’s kingdom. Help us recognize the voice of Christ — our voice — praising our God. Are you willing to imagine that this sound is the sweetest you will ever hear this side of the day of the Lord’s return?

---

9 Ibid., no. 10
The choir edition of *Catholic Book of Worship III* has recently been published; the pew edition will become available in the fall. This follows a number of years of preparation; we ought to be grateful to all who worked so hard and so faithfully to bring this work to completion.

Workshops to help introduce CBW III will be given in London, Ontario on July 14-16; in Halifax, Nova Scotia on August 25-27, and in Regina, Saskatchewan on September 8-10.

CBW III is an official liturgical book of the English-speaking church in Canada, and all parish ministers need to become familiar with it. To do so, begin by reading carefully Bishop Raymond Lahey's introductory letter on page ii. Then examine carefully the table of contents on page iii.

Note that the contents are divided into seven major areas:

- **Sacraments**
- **Other rites; clearly these two groups are closely related**
- **Liturgy of the Hours**
- **Lectionary Music for Sundays and Solemnities (chiefly, the responsorial psalm)**
- **Music for the Eucharist (Lord have mercy, Glory to God, Holy holy, etc.)**
- **Hymns, Psalms and Canticles (these comprise the bulk of the book)**
- **Indices (which are very helpful).**

As a worship book, and not just a hymnal, CBW III contains more than music. Note that two versions of the Lord's Prayer and four forms of profession of faith, are presented on the inside/front and back covers. These are for everyday use in parish liturgies.

The sections on Sacraments and on Other Rites (numbers 1-12) give the outline of all major rites of the church, provide responses that are called for, and supply some basic musical resources for these liturgies. Some of this material will be of use to all members of worshipping communities. Some will be especially useful for guests and visitors, those who are not so familiar with the contemporary Catholic liturgy. All who are responsible for hospitality (presiders, greeters, cantors — in fact, all members of the local community) will want to show appropriate parts of these sections to guests and visitors.

Liturgists, musicians and parish ministers will find the indices helpful. There are eight indices, of which the biblical indices and liturgical and topical indices
will be especially useful. Page through these and see how they are organized. Note that most of the music for the eucharist is under Eucharistic Celebration. However, music for the communion procession is not under eucharist, but is listed separately.

Sister Loretta Manzara, who with Reverend Murray Kroetsch have been the chief staff persons responsible for producing CBW III, says that she is perhaps most proud of the communion processional hymns that have been included. These are intended to communicate the message that eucharistic communion is not just between individuals and their Lord, but also among all the members of the assembly. The procession is a communal act of worship, not that of many individuals.

To become familiar with CBW III, musicians will want to go through its several sections, playing or singing through the musical offerings. This, of course, will take some time, but should be pursued in a consistent manner during the year. Musicians and pastors will want to find out what music is included that is already familiar to their community, and what is new.

An important task for musicians, as they become familiar with CBW III, is to make deliberate plans to introduce new material to their communities; they will want to expand the parish repertoire, and plan to do so over the course of the next several years. Of the new music in CBW III, they will want to choose material that is new, that is needed in terms of the liturgical "gaps" that may now exist in the music of the parish, and that is appropriate in terms of level of difficulty.

It may be helpful for musicians to copy parts of the liturgical and topics indices, and put on separate pages in a notebook the music for each season (Advent, for example) and for different liturgical occasions (eucharist, or funerals). The music listed can then be annotated. First, items that are already familiar may be noted. Then, decide on a reasonable number of pieces that you will introduce first. Having decided this, you can keep track of when they are first practiced by the musicians, when they are taught in the parish, and how often they are used until familiar to all.

Key words to be remembered by musicians as CBW III is introduced include "have fun learning the new music," and "plan ahead;" make a plan for the introduction of new music over the next two or three years. Of course you do not have to be rigid in following this plan. However, if you don't have a plan, there will be a great temptation to use only the music you now know, or to introduce new music in ways that may not meet the real liturgical needs of the community.
CATHOLIC BOOK OF WORSHIP III

The Official Hymnal for Canadian Catholics

a comprehensive resource incorporating quality selections from all styles of music-making

695 Entries: 404 Hymns and Canticles, plus Psalms and Acclamations

CHOIR EDITION (available now)

- 4 part harmony for hymns - indicated by using SATB stems
- organ accompaniment and guitar chords for all hymns, psalms and canticles
- refrains, psalm-tones and texts pointed for all Sunday responsorial psalms
  (with organ and guitar accompaniment)
- hymns intended to be sung in unison indicated by:
  a) a separate melody line OR
  b) melody stemmed separately from the keyboard accompaniment
- descants provided, may be used by voice or instrument
- improved indices: Refrain Index, Scriptural Index, Author/Translator/Composer/Arranger/Source Index, Metrical Index, Tune Index, Liturgical and Topical Index, Title and First Line Index
- all verses of hymns printed directly under the music

1280 pages, 15 x 23 cm., sewn, hard cover, gold imprint:
$40.39 ($34.95 + shipping & handling + GST)

PEW EDITION will be available later in 1994, at the price of $23.05 ($19.95 + shipping & handling + GST).

EASY PAYMENT PLAN AVAILABLE FOR ORDERS OF 50 COPIES OR MORE
(not applicable to discounted orders)

Place your order with:
Publications Service (CCCB)  Telephone (613) 241-7538
90 Parent Avenue  Fax (613) 241-5090
Ottawa, Ontario  TOLL FREE (in Canada) 1-800-769-1147
KIN 7B1

ALSO AVAILABLE IN BOOKSTORES